

Education Sector Support Programme in Nigeria (ESSPIN)

Assignment Report

SBMCs in Policy and Practice: Kaduna State Report

Report Number KD 401

Grace Akuto

April 2009

Report Distribution and Revision Sheet

Project Name: Education Sector Support Programme in Nigeria

Report Title: SMBCs in Policy and Practice: Kaduna State Report

Report No: ESSPIN KD 401

Rev No*	Date of issue	Originators	Checker	Approver	Scope of checking
1	August 2009	Grace Akuto	Aboki Fatima	Steve Baines	Formatting/Content

Distribution List

Name	Position
DFID	
Kathleen Richmond	Human Development Programme Coordinator, DFID
Ian Attfield	Education Adviser, DFID Northern Nigeria Office
ESSPIN	
John Martin	National Programme Manager
Ron Tuck	Deputy Programme Manager
Richard Hanson	Assistant Programme Manager
Steve Baines	Technical Team Coordinator
Abolaji Osime	State Team Leader Lagos
Emma Williams	State Team Leader Kwara
Richard Dalgarno	State Team Leader Kano
Steve Bradley	State Team Leader Kaduna
Kayode Sanni	State Team Leader Jigawa
John Kay	Lead Specialist, Education Quality
Alero Ayida-Otobo	Lead Specialist, Policy and Planning -Federal Level
Fatima Aboki	Lead Specialist, Community Interaction
Nguyan Feese	Lead Specialist, Inst. Development and Education Mgt
Francis Watkins	Lead Specialist, Social Development
Penny Holden	Lead Specialist, Inspectorates

Quality Assurance Sheet and Disclaimer

"This document has been prepared for the titled project or named part thereof and should not be relied on or used for any other project without an independent check being carried out as to its suitability and prior written authority of Cambridge Education Ltd. (CE) being obtained. Cambridge Education Ltd. accepts no responsibility or liability for the consequences of this document being used for a purpose other than the purpose for which it was commissioned. Any person using or relying on the document for such other purposes agrees, and will by such use and reliance be taken to confirm his agreement to indemnify Cambridge Education Ltd. for all loss and damage resulting there from. Cambridge Education Ltd. accepts no responsibility or liability for this document to any party other than the person by whom it was commissioned."

"To the extent that this report is based on information supplied by other parties, Cambridge Education Ltd. accepts no liability for any loss or damage suffered by the client, whether contractual or tortious, stemming from any conclusions based on data supplied by parties other than Cambridge Education Ltd. and used by Cambridge Education Ltd. in preparing this report."

Note on Documentary Series

This document is one of the series to be produced by Cambridge Education Consultants in support of their contract with the Department for International Development for the Education Sector Support Programme in Nigeria.

The documents include:

ESSPIN 001	ESSPIN 1 st Quarterly Report
ESSPIN 002	MTSS Strategy
ESSPIN 003	M&E Strategy
ESSPIN 004	Inception Strategy
ESSPIN 005	Report Re-assigned ESSPIN 204
ESSPIN 006	ESSPIN 3 rd Quarterly Report
ESSPIN 007	Report Re-assigned ESSPIN 205
ESSPIN 008	National Consultant Capacity Building Programme
ESSPIN 009	Report Reassigned ESSPIN 206
ESSPIN 010	Institutional Development, Public Finance Management – Scoping Visit
ESSPIN 011	Development of State – level Logframe for Kano and Jigawa States
ESSPIN 012	School Case Study Reports – Kaduna, Kano & Kwara States
ESSPIN 013	ESSPIN 4 th Quarterly Report
ESSPIN 201	Analysis of the Role of LGAs and LGEAs in Supporting Basic Education in Nigeria, December 08
ESSPIN 202	MTSS preparation in Jigawa, Kaduna and Kano State: Planning Task Specialist Visit 1
ESSPIN 203	Analysis of the Role of LGAs and LGEAs in supporting basic education in Nigeria, May 09
ESSPIN 204	Initial Report from the MTSS Task Team Leader
ESSPIN 205	Support to completion of MTSS in Lagos and Kwara States: Finance Task Specialist Visit 1
ESSPIN 206	Service to support the completion of MTSS in Lagos State: Task Team Leader Visit 2
ESSPIN 207	Further Support to the Completion of MTSS in Lagos & Kwara states: Task Team Leader Visit 3
ESSPIN 208	Progress Report on the MTSS Preparation in Jigawa, Kaduna and Kano: Planning Task Specialist Visit 2
ESSPIN 209	Support to the completion of Medium-term Sector Strategy (MTSS) for Jigawa, Kaduna and Kano: Finance Task Specialist Visit 1
ESSPIN 210	Support to the completion of Medium-term Sector Strategy (MTSS) for Jigawa, Kaduna and Kano: Finance Task Specialist Visit 2
ESSPIN 211	Services to support the completion of Medium-term Sector Strategies (MTSS) in Lagos & Kwara states: Task Team Leader Visit 4
ESSPIN 212	Support to the Completion of Medium-term Sector Strategy (MTSS) for Jigawa, Kaduna and Kano: Finance Task Specialist Visit 3, May 09
ESSPIN 213	Services to support the completion of Medium-term Sector Strategies (MTSS) in Lagos & Kwara states: Task Team Leader Visit 5

ESSPIN 214	Support to the Completion of Medium-term Sector Strategy (MTSS) for Jigawa, Kaduna and Kano: Finance Task Specialist Visit 4, June 09
ESSPIN 215	Support to the Completion of Medium-term Sector Strategy (MTSS) in Lagos and Kwara: International Finance Task specialist Visit 2 July 09
ESSPIN 216	Progress Report on the MTSS Preparation in Jigawa, Kaduna and Kano: Planning Task Specialist Visit 3 July 09
ESSPIN 217	Support to the Completion of Medium-term Sector Strategy in Lagos and Kwara: National Finance Task Specialist Visit 1 – 3
ESSPIN 301	Teaching and Learning Survey
ESSPIN 302	School Infrastructures and Maintenance Review for ESSPIN States
ESSPIN 303	Preparation for the Main Teaching and Learning Survey, May 2009
ESSPIN 401	School Based Management Committees Research February 09
ESSPIN 402	School Based Management Committees Research March 09
ESSPIN 403	IQTE integration work in Kano, Kaduna and Jigawa: Task Specialist Visit Reports 1 - 4
ESSPIN 501	Communications and Knowledge Management Strategy
ESSPIN 502	Communication Task Specialist Visit Report, December 08
ESSPIN 503	Education Management Information Systems (EMIS) - Scoping Mission
ESSPIN 504	Communication Task Specialist Visit Report, February 09
ESSPIN 505	Report on Scoping Visit to Develop BBCWST Communications Strategy for ESSPIN
ESSPIN 506	Education Management Information Systems (EMIS) May 09
ESSPIN 507	Communications Task Specialist Visit Report, April/May 09
ESSPIN 508	Knowledge Management Task Specialist Support Visit Report, Mar/April 09
ESSPIN 509	ICT Strategy Draft Report, April 09
ESSPIN 510	ICT Strategy Implementation Plan Draft Report April 09
ESSPIN 511	Development of ESSPIN Programme and Management Information Communication System
ESSPIN 512	Knowledge Management Support Visit Report, Oct 08
ESSPIN 513	Mapping ESSPIN Research Strategy, April 09
ESSPIN 514	Education Management Information Systems: Fourth Visit Report, June 09
ESSPIN 515	Task Specialist Support Communication Visit Report, June 09
ESSPIN 516	Monitoring and Evaluation Inception Phase Visit Reports 1 – 4
JG 301	An Assessment of Teacher Education in Jigawa State: Task Specialists Visit 1
JG 302	An Assessment of Teacher Education in Jigawa State: Task Specialists Visit 2
KD 301	Institutional Analysis of Teacher Education Structures in Kaduna State with Particular Focus on Gidan Waya College of Education: Task Specialists Visit 1
KD 302	Institutional Analysis of Teacher Education Structures in Kaduna State with Particular Focus on Gidan Waya College of Education: Task Specialists Visit 2
KD 401	SMBCs in Policy and Practice: Kaduna State Report

- KN 301 Education Institutional Development: Teacher Education Strategy for Kano State, Task Specialists Visit 1
- KN 302 Education Institutional Development: Teacher Education Strategy for Kano State, Task Specialists Visit 2
- KN 401 IQTEB Proposal for the Approval of Kano State Government, Jun 09
- KW 301 An Assessment of the Development needs of Teachers in Nigeria – Kwara State Case Study
- KW 302 Oro College Review of Strategic Priorities
- KW 303 Curriculum Transformation for College of Education Oro
- KW 304 Towards a Transformed Pre-Service Teacher Education Curriculum for College of Education Oro
- KW 305 Institutional Strengthening of Oro College
- KW 306 Teacher Strategy; Improving the Teaching of Literacy and Numeracy: Scoping visit
- KW 307 Institutional Strengthening at Oro College and Teacher Development Strategy
- KW 308 Curriculum Transformation at Kwara State College of Education

Contents

Report Distribution and Revision Sheet.....	ii
Quality Assurance Sheet and Disclaimer	iii
Note on Documentary Series.....	iv
Acronyms and Abbreviations.....	ix
Abstract.....	1
Introduction	1
Background	1
Kaduna State background.....	2
Education in Kaduna State	2
State level findings.....	3
Resources.....	3
Inclusivity	3
Communication.....	4
Influence	5
Improving education.....	5
LGA level findings (Zaria)	5
Background	5
Resources.....	6
Inclusivity	7
Communication.....	7
Influence	8
Improving education.....	8
LGA level findings (Kachia)	9
Background	9
Resources.....	9
Inclusivity	10
Communication.....	10
Influence	11
Improving education.....	11
KADUNA 2 LGEA PRIMARY SCHOOL.....	11
Background	11
Resources.....	14
Inclusivity	15
Membership.....	15
Communication.....	16
Influence	17
Improving education.....	18
Areas of Improvement	19
KADUNA 1 SCHOOL, REHABILITATION CENTRE, KACHIA	20
Background	20
Resources.....	23
Inclusivity	24
Communication.....	24

Influence 25

Improving education 25

Discussion & analysis 26

PTA Status 26

SBMC Policy 26

SBMC implementation 27

Governance 28

Community and context 29

Other interventions 29

Children and Women in SBMC..... 30

Teaching and Learning 30

Acronyms and Abbreviations

DFID	Department for International Development
ESP	Education Sector Plan
EPSSim	Education Policy and Strategy Simulation
ESSPIN	Education Sector Support in Nigeria
GEP	Girl Education Project
HT	Head Teacher
LGEA	Local Government Education Authority's
M&E	Monitoring and Evaluation
MDA	Ministry, Departments and Agencies
MEPB	Ministry of Economic Planning and Budget
MOE	Ministry of Education
MOF	Ministry of Finance
MOEST	Ministry of Education, Science and Technology
MTSS	Medium-term Sector Strategies
NEEDS	National Economic Empowerment and Development Strategy
PTA	Parents, Teachers Association
SDP	School Development Plan
SEEDS	State Economic Empowerment and Development Strategy
SMBC	School Based Management Committee
STL	State Team Leader
SUBEB	State Universal Basic Education Board
TNA	Training Need Analysis
TOR	Terms of Reference

Abstract

1. The main objectives of this consultancy are: (1) to contribute to the implementation of an in-depth case study analysis of the status of school-based management committees in ESSPIN states, so as to form a strong analytical foundation; and (2) to help explore the way forward to further expand and strengthen SBMC for improving education service delivery and outcome.

Introduction

Background

2. This school based management committee research being reported here was sponsored by Education sector programme in Nigeria, ESSPIN. ESSPIN is a Federal government of Nigeria programme supported by British government. ESSPIN's aim is to have a sustainable impact upon the way in which government in Nigeria delivers education services and is directed at enabling institutions to bring about systemic change in the education system, and building capacity for sustainability. It is currently operating in five States (Kano, Kaduna, Kwara, Jigawa and Lagos) and at the Federal level. The research was conducted in all the ESSPIN States. This report covers Kaduna State.
3. The Kaduna research team was led by a National consultant from the University of Agriculture, Makurdi. She was supported by a deputy director of Planning Research & Statistics (PRS) department from SUBEB Kaduna State, who was also the World Bank lead person in the School development scheme project. The third member of the team was a local NGO consultant from innovative consultancy services, based in Kaduna.
4. Head teachers, teachers, community leaders, women's leaders, fathers, mothers, NGO/CBO representatives, students and SBMC/PTA members were the participants in the study at the school and community level. Education secretaries and SBMC Desk officers at LGEA level and directors or deputy directors involved with SBMC at the level of the State were interviewed.
5. The research was participatory employing tools as SSIs, FGDs, Transect walk, Observation and social/resource mapping. State and LGEA interviews lasted a day each covering interviews with relevant officers who were chosen on the basis of their exposure to and knowledge of SBMCs. At the school/community levels, the team members took turns to conduct individual interviews or worked as a group in conduct of FGDS/observations in the school and community. School/community exercises took four days in each case ending with a whole community feedback. Care was taken to ensure female participants were interviewed by the female consultant especially in the Muslim areas & where it was possible. On the whole, participants were uninhibited in their responses to questions. Even the women in 'purdah' i.e. seclusion spoke openly and communicated their views about community/school development and participation.

Kaduna State background

Location

6. Kaduna State is situated in the North central part of Nigeria within the Savannah belt. Its is bordered by Kano/Katsina states on the North, Kebbi and Niger State on the West, Federal Capital, Nassarawa and Plateau States on the East.
7. Social Groups: There are 23 Local Governments in the state with many ethnic groups among which include Hausas, Fulani Jaba, Kataf Kaje, Bajju and the rest. Islam and Christianity are the predominant religions of the populace. There are other traditional religions which are in the minority. As many as there are different ethnic groups so is the state diverse in culture and traditions

Economic Activities

8. Farming is the major occupation of the people of Kaduna State. Industries are concentrated in the state capital. There other natural resources in the state like Gold in B/Gwari Local Government, ginger in Kachia Local Government etc. Trading activities is another source of means of livelihood for the people.

Education in Kaduna State

Status of Education

9. The level of educational awareness differs from place to place. Sharp difference can be seen between the Northern part of the State and the Southern part especially on girls' education. The Southern part accepts western education while the Northern part is not in total support of Western education perhaps due to influence of Islamic religion. The government of Kaduna State seem to be inclined towards positive changes. Education, basic education in particular is free for all in the state. Government gives free uniforms, exercise books and text books to pupils in some school. School based management committees (SBMCs) have been established in all primary schools in Kaduna State. Those under State education sector project are being funded, however, the rest of the schools are yet to be funded by government. Teachers have recently been given 5% extra allowances. Health services are free for pregnant women and children from 0 – 5 years in public hospitals. These developments no doubt give a ray of hope for improved access to education for the poor in the State.

State level findings

10. The assistant Director who is also designated the SBMC officer at the MOE took part in the Interview, while at SUBEB, The director PRS granted interview with the Team in the absence of the SUBEB SBMC Desk Officer. Some of the issues were not fully responded to because the SUBEB PRS Director did not have hands on experience of SBMC again. The interviews lasted over one & half hours at the State/LGEA levels because they were conducted in their offices amidst interruptions of official duty. In spite of the limitations, interviews with Ministry of education (MOE) and Universal Basic Education Board (SUBEB) participants on SBMCs revealed quite useful State level insights on the situation of SBMC in the State. *In summary one would say that in many respects their views of SBMC were more theoretical than real.* The state and LGEA level findings are presented followed by case studies of the two schools.
11. The findings are presented according to the RIC model which has four components: resources, inclusivity, communication and influence.

SBMC and other institutions

12. It was gathered that there is a close relationship between SBMCs and other organisations/institutions as PTA, School, community, LGEA, and CBOs/NGOs (MOE/SUBEB Participant). The organisations relate with SBMCs in terms of shared membership, information, decisions and activities. The LGEA is said to be very central in the coordination of school and SBMC activities (SUBEB Participant).

Resources

13. Financial resources do not come from Federal, State or LGEA to SBMCs. The fund allocation that comes from Federal to State and LGEA is used for teachers' salaries, overhead costs at LGEA and supply of some teaching materials to the schools (e.g. chalk, scheme of work, diaries, exercise books and exercise books). The only source of funds to SBMC is through the grant by the education sector support programme (SESP) of the State. Another source of funding for the school was the PTA levy. This has been abolished by the government in the last two years. When PTA and schools were generating money internally through levies from schools, 80% was jointly used by the Head teachers and PTA to solve priority school problems.

Inclusivity

14. Care is taken to ensure that SBMC membership is representative. Women, children, religious groups, artisans, teachers, old boys and women are elected as SBMC members. Women's participation and role in SBMC consists of attending meetings contributing to decision- making sensitizing other women in the community on education and disseminating SBMC decisions to women. However, the MOE participant pointed out that cultural practices limit women's active participation in SBMC.

Process of formation

15. On the composition of SBMCS, participants indicated satisfaction that SBMCS have been constituted according to guidelines and showed the list of members sent to them from the various schools.
16. **Action taken by State participants to implement SBMC in the State included** carrying out sensitization workshops at senatorial and divisional levels to enlighten stakeholders on guidelines for formation and roles and responsibilities of SBMCS (SUBEB). SBMC desk officers appointed to ensure SBMCS meet twice every term and reports to MOE headquarters (No.2&3 MOE participants). *However, we did not see any evidence of SBMC report to the MOE*
17. Specifically State officials disseminated SBMC guidelines to all divisions and education Secretaries of LGEAS who subsequently sent same to schools with a circular to set up SBMCS. While the MOE participant expressed satisfaction with SBMC because the Schools and the communities have become aware of the importance of SBMCS as a decentralised structure for school control, the SUBEB participant said he is unhappy because SBMCS are not functional at the moment.
18. **Challenges faced in SBMC implementation** – These were identified as lack of monitoring of SBMCS activities by State and SUBEB officials, inability to adequately train using the manual because it's in English and not well understood by the community people and finally non availability of literate people in the community to manage SBMC as most literate people live in the towns.
19. **Important role of SBMCS & Children** – The most important role of SBMC was said to be: to sensitize the community on the importance of education of their children and to oversee the activities of the school, i. e. monitoring role. Role of children in SBMCS is to represent the interest of pupils but they are not active participants since they are hardly invited for meetings.

Communication

20. Policies at federal State, LGEA and schools are communicated through circulars while at the community level it is through meetings and sometimes through public campaigns, workshops and seminars.
21. SBMCS decisions are communicated to other levels through their representatives e.g. pupils, village head, women, PTA etc.
22. SBMCS communicate their decisions to the State through school heads to the LGEA and unto the SUBEB/MOE. E.g. information such as a donation given or made by an individual or group. The MOE subsequently sends a letter of recommendation to the groups/individuals.

When and how SBMC came about

23. SUBEB and MOE participants 1st heard of SBMC 2003/2004 while at LGEA as the chief education officer and at the National council on education (NCE) in 2005 respectively. One view was that SBMC originated from NCE and another person said from UNICEF. Whatever is the case the Federal government is responsible for introducing SBMC into the schools.

Influence

- State Ministry of Education is accountable to Federal Ministry of Education and SUBEB is accountable to UBEC.
- The SBMCS in JSS and primary schools are accountable to MOE and SUBEB respectively.
- The social mobilisation officer at SUBEB monitors SBMCS (SUBEB participant).
- The desk officers at the divisional levels monitor SBMC activities at the community level (MOE Participant).
- Monitoring of school quality- the inspectorate department at SUBE and MOE monitors' school quality.
- Tension and conflict areas in the system - MOE participant reports of tension between school head teachers and SBMCS who see the SBMCS as a threat to check their activities.
- Why? This tension created by lack of proper understanding of their roles and responsibilities.
- The SUBEB man was unsure if there were any conflict or tensions in the systems.

Improving education

24. **Changes in schools due to SBMCS** - increased enrolment and retention especially for the girls were reported as being due to introduction of SBMCS in schools. Other changes include steady provision of chalk by SBMC, increased numbers of classroom blocks constructed by SBMCS and preparation of school plans especially in SESP schools. *This contradicts the view of the SUBEB participants who said SBMCS are not functioning well in schools at the moment.*
25. **Suggestions for improvements** – States and Federal government to provide funds to SBMCS directly for school development instead of contractors who inflate contract costs. Sensitisation campaigns for stakeholders on the functions of SBMCS should be continued. Step up monitoring of SBMCS and give allowances to SBMC members to serve as incentives.
26. **The question raised by participant** – what provision has ESSPIN made as per the inclusion of desk officers of the State in ESSPIN activities with SBMCs?

LGA level findings (Zaria)

Background

27. Zaria LGA is located in the Northern part of Kaduna State. It is in a semi- desert area. The main work of the rural dwellers is farming and cattle rearing. There are petty and big time traders within Zaria LGA. Zaria City houses one of the oldest Emirs in the far North. He is also the chairman of Emirs in Kaduna State.
28. There are several Primary and secondary schools as well as institutions of higher learning, including the Nigerian aviation college, State college of education and polytechnic in Zaria LGA. The major tribes in Zaria are the Hausas, Fulani's with a few other natives as settlers. Inhabitants of Zaria city are predominately Muslims with Christians in Wusasa area, the southern part of Zaria LGA.

29. **Local Government Education Authority (LGEA), Zaria** – The findings presented below derive from the interaction with the LGEA Education Secretary and the SBMC/SDC Officers at the LGEA level.

Resources

Funds- Resource flow from LGA – LGEA

30. Funds for projects are remitted to SBMCs direct from State through SESP project. Funds for teachers and LGEA staff salaries flow from SUBEB to LGEA and unto the schools (ES interv). Old boys and other community persons donate funds through SBMCs for school renovation, construction of classrooms and supply of learning materials such as pencils/biros ex. books. For e.g. an old boy constructed a vocation centre in one school in the LGA and equipped it with sewing machines, knitting machines and computers. He also paid for the training of pupils (ES interview).
31. Communities and sometimes members of SBMCs and PTA levy parents to construct classroom buildings and other development projects in schools (ES & DO), e.g. SBMCs dug wells in a school (DO). However, since the abolition of PTA levy, funds are raised through individuals except in cases of grants such as in SESP schools. SBMC donate funds and labour for school projects (ES/DO). Some SBMC members also give their voluntary services as part-time teachers to the school.

Skills and Capacity

32. Training workshops for SBMCs have been conducted by the State (DO & ES). ever, one still wonders whether the capacity needed to implement SBMC is adequate.

Training & Support

- Teachers educational training sponsored by JAICAS (a programme of Japanese Government in Nigeria) supported by LGEA.
- SBMCs receive training on their roles and responsibilities organised by SMOE/SUBEBs.
- States organised trainings workshops for teachers to improve on their teaching skills.

Networks/Relationships

- The community, school, PTA, SBMC are closely linked in terms of information Sharing, activities for school improvement.
- The LGEA is also linked to the school, PTA and SBMCs while the state is linked to the LGEA & the SBMC of the school (ES & DO)
- JICA also relates with the school via teacher training

Motivation and Reward

- LGEA sends/appreciation letters to individuals & organisations that contribute to school development (ES)
- LGEA gives immediate feedback or response on SBMC decisions and problems (ES)
- There isn't any plan for reward of SBMC members (DO).

Inclusivity

Membership

33. SBMCs in schools have been formed according to guiding notes. They reported that their SBMC members are 19. The women, children, old boys, artisans, community leader religious representatives etc are all represented.

Processes of Formation

34. Through meeting with District officers (DO), head teachers & members of the community to decide on the most suitable members in SBMCs (ES & DO).

Participation of Women & Children

- Women participate by giving donation and actively taking part in decision – making (ES)
- Children participate by attending the SBMC meetings “but they are more of listeners, (ES)
- Children participate in SBMCs by pointing to the needs of the children & problems with their teachers, e.g. a head boy of one school has gone for SDs (school development scheme) workshop in Abuja. (DO)

The Role of Women

- Enlighten women at home to allow their children to attend school (instead of hawking) (ES & DO). They talk to other women the implication of education for their children.
- Women make donation for school projects (ES)
- Women communicate SBMC decisions to other women (ES).

The Role of the Poor

- The SBMCs assist children whose parents cannot afford some contributions by paying for them or waving it.
- The poor are very relieved because in present government, PTA levies have been abolished and ex. books, text books and even uniforms are being provided by Government. (ES).

The Role of Children

- They communicate problems of children to SBMCs (ES)
- They report on SBMC activities/decisions to the school children (ES)
- They also communicate problems of school situations to SBMC (DO)

Communication

Profile and presence of SBMC

35. All LGEA schools have functioning SBMCs. Some are actively supported by individuals, LGEAs, NGOs, PTAs and the community.

Communication of SBMC Decisions to wider community

36. The SBMC decisions are communicated to the wider community in writing, phone calls, through announcement in churches and mosques. They also communicate through representatives to the wider community.

Communication between school and SBMC

37. School communicate with SBMC through the head teacher and from SBMC to school through the same channel (ES). The SBMC communicate through notice board and verbally (D.O)

Communication between LGEA & SBMC

- LGEA communicate to SBMCs through delegation to their meetings.
- Decisions of SBMC are conveyed to LGEA in writing.

Tensions & Conflicts

38. Initially there were conflicts between PTA and SBMCs but was resolved through meetings and sensitizations, (E.S). Sometimes conflicts come up between H/teachers and SBMCs especially about money but SBMCs always have the upper hand, (E.S).

Influence

Accountability

- (i) LGEA is accountable to LGC and SUBEB because funds disbursed have to be accounted for and staff duties.
- (ii) SBMC is accountable to LGEA e.g. recently a principal mismanaged grant and the LGEA made the principal to refund the money - A community member reported this misappropriation to the LGEA office (ES)
- (iii) LGEA is monitored by SUBEB and LGC
- (iv) Community members also monitor SBMC activities.

School Quality

- (i) LGEA through PRS and School services monitor school quality, ES/DO
- (ii) SBMC, PTA and community leaders monitor school quality e.g. this week it was reported that teachers in a school were not performing their duties well. **A supervisor was sent to look into the issue.**

Within SBMC who makes decision?

- (i) Decisions in SBMCs are jointly taken in meetings **however sometimes there are conflicts e.g.** SBMC chair in one school tried to impose his decision on members threatening to resign if they don't accept. Members refused and asked him to put his resignation in writing. He refused saying majority carry the vote (Power tussle) (ES).
- (ii) In another school, the SBMC chair tried to overpower the head teacher to follow his decision but other members objected
- (iii) LGEA gives directives to SBMCs, however where there is objection, LGEA rescinds its decision.
- (iv) Priorities of school are determined by SBMCs the LGEA only advice.

Improving education

- (i) Increase sensitization of SBMCs/community on their roles and responsibilities
- (ii) More capacity building on project implementation and fund management

Access

- (i) Increase enrolment/retention of pupils in school especially in the rural areas
- (ii) More children now transit to JSS especially girls
- (iii) Teaching and learning in schools has improved as a result of the teachers professional development (TPD) by SESP

Quality

- Abolition of levies, supply of uniform, text books, exercise books and other teaching materials by LGEA, LGC, SUBEB, SBMC and individuals has led to improve quality in school.

LGA level findings (Kachia)**Background**

- 39. Kachia Local Government is one among the 23 local government areas in Kaduna State. It is one of the oldest LGAS created in the 70s by the Military administration of General Yakubu Gowon. Kachia local government area is located in the southern part of Kaduna state. It is bordered by Kagoro LGA in the north, Kagarko and Jaba LGAs in the West, Jama'a, Saya & Z/Kataf in the South and Lere & Kauru in East. It has rich vast land for agricultural activities.
- 40. The LGA consist of 3 major ethnic groups like the Adora, Jaba, Bluturim and a few minorities like Bajju, Hausas, Fulani and Gbayi. These ethnic groups are predominantly Christian with a few Muslims and traditional worshipers (religious).
- 41. Most of the inhabitants of the LGA are agricultural farmers with Ginger as their cash crop and source of income. There are a few commercial banks in the LGA Head quarters. There is also where the Nigerian Military authority located, the military rehabilitation centre in Kachia. There are several primary and secondary schools in Kachia LGA. The Kaduna 1 primary school lies in the centre of Kachia.

Resources**Financial & Other Materials Resources**

- SBMCs & PTAs not funded by Government. Funds for salaries of LGEA staff and teachers/overhead come from LGA accounts to SUBEB unto LGEA. SBMCs raise funds to support the schools through Self-levies.
- LGEA supplies chalk, register and diaries for teachers in schools. SUBEB provide furniture's to schools. LGEAs also sponsor workshops/seminars for teachers.
- LGEAs encourage part-time training of staff.
- LGEAs initiate and implement teachers' promotion with approval from SUBEB.
- There aren't other ways of reward

Inclusivity

Membership

42. SBMC membership is decided at the LGEA level by the PRS department (ES), but the desk officer said SBMC membership is decided through PTA meeting with the community, adding that members are selected based on the guidelines. Women and children are SBMC members too. Women participate in SBMC meetings by contributing their views on school quality. They also support school projects by fetching water and giving their labour in carrying blocks for building (ES).

Roles of Women and Children in SBMC

- Women's role in SBMC is to draw the attention of other women to support their children school's in terms of feeding, attendance and participation in school activities.
- Children role in SBMC is to point out the teachers' lapses and maltreatment of children in school DO.

The role of the poor

- Levies have been abolished in Kaduna schools by the present government so the poor are relieved of financial burden for their children. ES Kachia said, "If you want to dent your name in town ask for levies".

Communication

Profile & presence of SBMC

43. SBMCs are present in all schools in the LGEA Kachia. There is close relationship between SBMC & PTA/School, community and LGEA in terms of information sharing and development activities in the school. Desk Officer and ES claimed SBMCs in Kachia are functional but could not give any example of what they are doing.

Communication of SBMC decisions

44. SBMCs communicate its decisions to the wider community through community leader, the school children and by announcement in churches and mosques. Communication between school and SBMC is done through the head teacher.

Communication between LGEA and the SBMC

- is through circulars, notice board, phone calls or verbal information via the Head Teachers.

Conflicts & Tension

45. Conflict is non-existent among the various organisations relating on school matters. However, in the posting of teachers there is an undue influence by politicians who insist on teachers being posted to particular schools even where such school are over- staffed.

Influence

Accountability

46. LGEA is accountable to SUBEB and sometimes to the LGC while SBMC is accountable to LGEA (DO). Another view is that SBMCs are not accountable to anybody because they are not funded.
47. SBMCs are monitored by PRS staff of the LGEA, e.g. the ES reported that a request by PRS staff to hold sensitization trainings with district education officers, head teachers, PTA/ SBMCs on the roles of SBMCs had been presented to her for approval.

Monitoring of school quality

48. The school services department of LGEA through DEO/Supervisor/education committees at 3 levels – LGA, District and ward monitor school quality. *(It's worth noting that the education committee was mentioned only by the LGEA participants. No community/school member said anything about them. It's worth seeking to know more about them.)*

Who makes decisions within SBMCs

49. Decisions are made in SBMC meetings. Agenda for meeting is set by SBMC chair/secretary (DO). The ES who is newly posted was not aware how decisions on SBMC are made.

Improving education

50. SBMCs can be improved by:
 - Fund provision
 - Monitoring of SBMC activities
 - More awareness sensitization workshops to enlighten members & communities on roles/responsibilities of SBMCs
 - Provision of mobility for Desk Officers to supervise SBMC activities.

KADUNA 2 LGEA PRIMARY SCHOOL

Background

51. The school/Community - Kaduna 2 LGEA primary school is the first SBMC case study school found in Zaria Local government Area (LGA) of Kaduna State. It is a rural school, located in Kaduna 2 community, 1 Km off the express Zaria- Kaduna road.
52. Key features of the community - Kaduna 2 community is located in the southern part of Zaria LGA. It is bordered by big rocks in the eastern part of the community. The land is a semi-desert place with sparse distribution of trees. The houses are made up of mud and settlement is in clusters leaving large farm land in the community. Kaduna 2 has no electricity or pipe born water. Their source of water is bore holes and hand dug wells. They have 1 primary school 5 qur'anic schools and Islamia School for women and children. There is no market, post office, polices post nor motor park but they have a small clinic.

53. Economic Activities - The community members are principally peasant farmers who engage in cattle/sheep and goats rearing, cereal farming and dry-season farming. Tailoring, carpentry and petty trading are also popular in the community.
54. Social groups - The inhabitants are mainly Hausas with Islam as the Major religion living peacefully with one another. Early marriage is very prominent in the community with consequent effect of poor school attendance by girls.
55. Key findings for this case study include: the school has a functional SBMC funded by SESP with members that are trained. However, there is poor participation in the SBMC by community members particularly women and the children. There is also poor information flow horizontally and vertically. The community is a cohesive one with close affinity among members and a homogeneous religion. Cultural and religious practices limit participation of women in development activities of the school and the community in general. The SBMC chairman and the head teacher are highly respected for their commitment to the development of the community. Other findings include:
- The school is made up of two blocks of 6 class rooms, the head teachers' office and a reserved store room adjacent to his office. There are no offices for teachers. It is a single shift school with some classes as large as 91 pupils i.e. (combined classes 1a &1b due to inadequate classrooms).
 - The school has one block of 3 toilets (one for boys, one for girls and one for teachers). There is also a separate block for convenience (urinating) with sections for boys and girls.
 - The school has a hand-dug well which is well covered and a bore hole under construction.
 - There is a play ground in the school but there are no games facilities of any kind in the school.
 - The school is located on the southern part of Kaduna 2 500m off Zaria-Kaduna road at the entrance to the community.
56. School Records and Materials - The school has the following resources/materials:
- School attendance register for children
 - Visitors book
 - Teaching Aids
 - Charts
 - Teachers/pupils textbooks
 - Exercise books for pupils
 - Writing materials. However, the following are lacking in the school:
 - Teachers' tables and chairs
 - Staff rooms
 - Desk and chairs for pupils from primary 1 – 6.
57. First aid box (available but not in use). Parents do not allow their children to be treated in school for fear that their children may be given drugs which may prevent them from giving birth (HT interview).

58. Total of 6 teachers in the school (HT inclusive) all males. Total number of pupils in the schooling is 358 with girls been 128 and boys 230 with the difference being 102 pupils in favour of boys. This high difference confirms the views of women on limited opportunities for girl child education in the community. According to the women, men usually resist girl child education claiming that 'the education of girls end in the kitchen'.

Community Institutions/Associations

59. The institutions identified in the community include:
- SBMC
 - PTA
 - Jama'atu Nasril-Islam
 - Farmers Association Multipurpose cooperative society
 - Kaduna 2 Development Association.
 - Vigilante group
 - Dry season farmers (men only)
 - Kaduna 2 United foot ball club
60. However, women group did not mention JNI, Vigilant group, Development Association and Multipurpose Cooperative society because they have no knowledge of the existence of these associations. However, the women expressed a strong desire to have a female only organisation through which they can address their personal development needs, contribute to the development of the community and the school in particular. This request along with another on attendance of adult education for women was formally presented by women through the research team during the community feedback.
61. **Relationship** – There is cordial relationship among all the listed organizations in the community. PTA was identified as having very close relationship with SBMC within the school in the areas of shared decisions; information sharing, functions and membership. Other organizations were linked with the SBMC in-terms of contribution of labour, information from SBMC and advice on school/pupils.
62. **Organisations Supporting the School** – In the immediate past PTA was said to be the one and only organisation, described as 'the all in all' (Venn diagram with men) that rendered support to the school through school levies collected from pupils. With the abolition of the school levies by Government about two years now, PTA of the school has become incapacitated. Not long ago PTA and SBMC as well as members of other organisations jointly partitioned a classroom by erecting a mud wall. It was through individual contribution of funds and labour. Presently it is SBMC that fund development projects in the school through the SESP grant. SBMC has fixed doors/windows, burglary proof on windows; dug a well in the school, purchased teaching aids and some text books for teachers and pupils. They have also supplied writing materials to pupils and renovated the classroom floors and corridors. The other organisations listed do contribute labour, time and advice. A parallel development project in the school complementing the work of SBMC is the bore hole under construction and the completed toilets and conveniences by the Nigerian MDG programme.

Reading and Writing

63. **Pupils' ability to read/Write** - Pupils inability to read in Primary 6, was blamed on the teacher, the child and the parents. However, the teacher has the greatest blame from primary 1-6. It was reasoned that if the foundation laid in the junior classes was good, then the primary six teachers will build on it. However apart from poor method of teaching of teachers, it was argued that some schools like Kaduna 2 are under-staffed. Lack of teaching materials and etc all contribute to poor performance of teachers. For the Pupils, lack of interest and inattentiveness to school work and lack of writing materials contribute. The parents, on the other hand reasons are poor feeding of children and failure to monitor the child's progress in schools.

Resources

Financial and other material Resources

64. The main sources of financial contributions to SMBC are:
- The grant from the State Government
 - Individual contribution of funds (For instance, before the SESP grant, SBMC members had to raise money through individual contribution to open and account for the school).
 - Individual and group contribution of labour e.g. PTA, SBMC and other groups partitioned Classrooms in the school with mud blocks (HT and teacher interview). One woman gave 10 birth certificate forms in school as incentives for good performance of pupils (HT, interview and woman leader interview).

Skills & Capacity

65. "SBMC members" showed poor understanding of their roles and responsibilities except the chair/HT. Their capacity needs include: school monitoring, financial management, advocacy and resource mobilization.

Training & Support

66. SMBC members have had training in the following areas:
- School budgeting
 - Financial guidelines on grant usage
 - Planning (SDP; school development planning)
 - Record keeping of expenses
 - SBMC role and responsibilities

Networks

67. There was no direct networking reported but peer review workshop conducted by SESP gave SBMC the opportunities to share experiences with other SBMCs of different schools. The SBMC chair said he found this a very beneficial exercise.

Motivation and Reward

68. SBMC members reported that their motivation derives from the recognition they enjoy in the community and the trust reposed in them as well as appreciation of the work they do. E.G chairman SBMC said his recognition as SBMC chairman contributed to his being appointed as the district chairman health committee (interview with SBMC chair, 3.4 page 34)
69. SBMC and other community members interviewed expressed the view that allowances should be paid to SBMC members as incentives.

Inclusivity

Membership

70. According to the list given by the HT, there are 19 members of SBMC fairly constituted according to the guidelines. There are representatives from women, pupil, artisans, old boys', religious groups, traditional rulers and teachers. Details of SBMC composition is as follows:
 - (i) SBMC chair who is also the community leaders
 - (ii) That teacher who is the secretary
 - (iii) The PRO who is a community member and a representative of PTA
 - (iv) Two other PTA representatives
 - (v) Four representatives of old boys-all males
 - (vi) The head boy and the head girl
 - (vii) Seven women representatives from the community
 - (viii) One other community member
71. Variations were observed in this composition. For instance, instead of two representatives male and female from each organisation, PTA had three male representatives, old boys had 4 all males, and women were 7 as floor members from the community. Even while in the community persons representing SBMC kept changing. On the whole, it appears that SBMC membership is not properly formed and is unclear to some members and community people how it should be.

Process of formation

- A circular was sent to the HT through the LGEA for the formation of SBMC
- The HT informed the community and PTA leaders who called for a meeting of the community for briefing.
- Members of SBMC were therefore elected and others selected during the community meeting. "I myself was elected to serve as SBMC chair on that day". (3.2 community leader interview page 52)
- The process of formation was confirmed by community members during the feedback meeting.
- SBMC is divided into several sub-committees e.g. implementation community, market survey committee, purchasing committee (SBMC, chair 4.6 PP 35)

72. **Observation** - We gathered from discussions with individuals and women that women and the pupils were not in the meeting. We also noted that the majority of the men were ignorant about the formation process of SBMC in the community, thus indicating poor participation by members. The minutes show that one or 2 women attend meetings, yet the women themselves could not remember attending meeting once. Clearly, women just as children are SBMC members on paper. In spite of these evidences, community members confirmed the formation process adding that they have noted everything.

Roles of Women in SBMC

- Mobilize parents to send their children to school (HT, women, community leader, SBMC chair) especially girls.
- Sensitize other women on education of their children (community leader)
- Make financial contribution e.g. community women contributed to sponsor pupils for Qua’ranic recitation competition (3.5, PP41, HT).
- They monitor to ensure children attend school especially the 2 mallamais (also volunteer teachers at Kaduna 2 LGEA School).
- Attend meetings and contribute to decision during meetings (SBMC chairman) PP.35, 4.4.

Role of the Poor

73. No particular role or plan for the poor in SBMC. But the supply of exercise/text books and writing materials has encouraged school enrolment and attendance including the poor children.

Role of the Children

- They pass information on SBMC to the PRO, Mallam Aminu Shehu (HT).
 - They attend meetings and contribute to decisions, especially when asked. (SBMC chairman and HT)
 - The pupils have no role in SBMC meetings – (women) & “I have never seen them attend SBMC meeting (non-SBMC male teacher).
74. Evidence from the minutes showed that the children attended the meeting once when the LGEA supervisors came on visit to the school. These responses seem to be more theoretical than real as the pupils they showed little knowledge of SBMC activities.

Communication

Profile and presence of SBMC

75. **Profile** - The Head Teacher got information to establish SBMC from the LGEA and relayed it to the school, whole community. SBMC was established in the school on 13th March, 2007.
76. **Presence of SBMC** – The presence of the SBMC is felt by all community members due to the recent development activities implemented in the school by SBMC, e.g. distribution of writing materials, exercise/text books to all pupils, sinking of hand-dug well, fixing of burglary proof on windows and classroom doors/windows, repairs of classroom corridors and floors. From our observations, the SBMC is being run mainly by three key officers – the chair, the secretary and the PRO who is very popular among the women and children as a go between people. This is evident from the lack of

knowledge of amount of grant, school development plan and people being co-opted to sit as SBMC members on our interviews.

Communication of SBMC Decision to the wider Community

77. This is done through town criers, letters, verbal messages, meetings etc. Examples town crier announces for meetings and major decisions of SBMC e.g. banning the selling of food items in the school by children (SBMC/Men PP63, 6.2). Women group said SBMCs do not communicate its decisions to them (PP 70, 8.2). *This clearly reveals the contradiction in the information across groups/individual on SBMC's work.*

Communication between school and SBMC

78. This is done mainly through the head teacher, e.g the non- SBMC teacher interviewed confirmed he heard about SBMC from the head teacher.

Communication between SBMC & LGEA

79. LGEA communicate to SBMC through the head teacher who is the Secretary of SBMC. They use letter, phone calls and verbal directives. SBMC communicate to LGEA through reports and visits as well as verbal information.

Tension and conflict

80. A cordial relationship among all the organizations in the community with SBMC was reported by all groups and individuals. The relationship between PTA and SBMC was described by groups as “Kamar Jini de Tsoka”, meaning like flesh and blood – Page 63, 6.1 SBMC group interview). Examples such as below were given to demonstrate the nature of the cordial relationship.

- PTA and SBMC jointly traced a school and got him to replace a stolen chalk board (HT)
- PTA and SBMC work together on matters of security, resource mobilisation for expenses (printing and SESP receipts, funding journeys of officials of SBMC).

Influence

Accountability

81. The men and the women SBMC group said that SBMC is accountable to its members and the community while the men's group said the SBMC is accountable to the PTA because of their close link. (P.63 6.5)
82. The school is accountable to the LGEA & SBMC group, but the men and women groups have different views. The men said that the school was accountable to the PTA because PTA was the 'all-in-all', but now it is accountable to both SBMC and PTA. On the other hand the women said the school is accountable to Mal. Aminu Shehu (PRO SBMC). This understanding may be based on the liaison role played by the PRO for the women the school.
83. From the responses it is clear that the level of understanding about accountability is different among the groups especially the women group who sees Mal. Aminu Shehu (PRO), (an intermediary between

the school/SBMC and the women) as the person the school is accountable to. This could be as a result of lack of exposure to the outside work.

84. The SBMC group said LGEA is accountable to the state while the men's group said the LGEA is accountable to the SBMC. The women said they do not know (Clear indication of ignorance). The concept of accountability was not clear to the participants' inspite of thorough explanation in Hausa.

Within the SBMC, Who makes decision?

85. The school makes decision on school matters (P.70 – 8.4)

SBMC power and influence in relation to school and other local institutions

86. SBMC is seen as more powerful in school matters. SBMC in collaboration with PTA makes decisions on resource application in the school (P.63 – 6.4) (horizontal influence).

SBMC power and influence in relation to LGEA

87. The SBMC has the power and influence to determine their needs and priorities as they affect the school, the LGEA only advises and approves.
88. The SBMC have power to execute their school development plans. (Vertical). This means that decision –making about the school can eventually be greatly influenced by the community. The implication is democratisation of development at the grass roots.

Possibilities for promoting collective action for change

89. There is no conflict and organizations are working together and have the will to continue to work together.
90. Women are very eager to participate in educational development activities by showing interest to form a CBO and to attend adult education class. The women collectively made a request of this at the feedback meeting and the chief granted their request. (presently the women are in the process of forming their CBO immediately after the research teams visit).
91. Increase awareness on SBMC will lead to greater contributions by individuals and communities on school projects.

Improving education

Contributions of organizations towards improved education (Access, equity and quality)

- (i) The PTA, for example, contributes to school development by way of advice, monitoring visit to school and contribution of resources for school development.
- (ii) The other organizations support SBMC and the school by attending meetings, contributing their views, labour, time and financial resources.
- (iii) The women give voluntary services to the school, such as teaching, mobilizing parents to release their children to school, sensitizing women, helping poor children and orphans by providing uniforms.
- (iv) The fact that SBMC has supplied exercise books and writing materials has led to increase in the number of children attending school now e.g. School enrolment this increased from 340 to 360 pupils now. Those that have enrolled attend school regularly too unlike before.

The prevailing context and effect

- (i) The limited participation of some SBMCs and other community members in the SBMC activities did not cripple their cordial relationship. *The research activity seemed an eye to more areas of cooperation.*
- (ii) Despite the abolition of levy in school, PTA is still working cordially with SBMC for school development. Such unity can be caped upon for maximum performance of SBMC.
- (iii) Despite increase in the school enrolment, girls' education is still limited because of the belief by men of the community that "girls' education ends in the kitchen" (Women Venn diagram group). Retention and completion of girls' education presents a great challenge.
- (iv) The head teacher is hard working committed, resourceful with good human relation and very willing to support school development activities.
- (v) There is mutual trust and harmonious working relationship between the SBMC chair and the head teacher.
- (vi) It is a small community where most members are related by blood and the main religion is Islam.

Areas of Improvement

- (i) Regular monitoring of SBMCs activities in school.
 - (ii) There should be ingenious ways to involve women and children in all SBMC activities in school.
 - (iii) More training for SBMC members in school planning, monitoring, advocacy and resource mobilization and in their roles and responsibilities.
 - (iv) There should be experience sharing workshops from SBMCs of different schools to improve practice. Introduction of SBMC allowances as a source of incentives.
 - (v) The women demanded for an adult education classes in the community and to be allowed to form a CBO where they can collectively work to support the schooling of their children.
92. In addition to the suggestions above by participants the team further suggests; increased community participation, community based trainings of SBMC members in clusters, community wide sensitization, advocacy to bodies and individuals for support, improved transparency and accountability in and ingenious ways to involve women and children without violating values.
93. **Impact of PTA activities in school.** The benefits of PTA activities in the school as explained by participants include:
- (i) Learning environment of the school is made more conducive, with toilets repairs of blown off roofs.
 - (ii) Provision of text and learning materials has contributed to improved teaching/learning and quality of education
 - (iii) Additional classrooms under construction will reduce congestion in classes and enhance effective teaching.
 - (iv) Availability of portable drinking water contributes to preventable water borne diseases.

KADUNA 1 SCHOOL, REHABILITATION CENTRE, KACHIA

Background

94. Kachia Local Government is one among the 23 local government areas in Kaduna State. It is one of the oldest LGAs created in the 70s by the Military administration of General Yakubu Gowon. Kachia local government area is located in the southern part of Kaduna state. It is bordered by Kagoro LGA in the north, Kagarko and Jaba LGAs in the West, Jama'a, Saya & Z/Kataf in the South and Lere & Kauru in East. It has rich vast land for agricultural activities.
95. The LGA consist of 3 major ethnic groups like the Adora, Jaba, Bluturim and a few minorities like Bajju, Hausas, Fulani and Gbayi. These ethnic groups are predominantly Christian with a few Muslims and traditional worshipers (religious).
96. Most of the inhabitants of the LGA are agricultural farmers with Ginger as their cash crop and source of income. There are a few commercial banks in the LGA Head quarters. There is also where the Nigerian Military authority located, the military rehabilitation centre in Kachia. There are several primary and secondary schools in Kachia LGA. The Kaduna 1 primary school lies in the centre of Kachia.

Type of School

97. It is Peri –urban and 200 meters off Kachia – Kaduna Road at the head quarters of the LGA.
98. **Location of the School** - It is located in the Northern part of Kachia town within the army rehabilitation centre. The school is surrounded by vast land and other neighbouring communities.

Key Features of the Community

99. **Facilities**- The community has electricity, pipe borne water, bore holes, hand dug wells, Banks, Churches, Mosques, one mission Primary School and a Mission Secondary School. There is a clinic, guest inns, Water board staff quarters, army barracks, and the chief of Adara house.
100. **Economic Activities** - Most inhabitants are farmers with few petty traders and artisans. There are also some civil servants in the community.
101. **Social Groups** - There are about 10 different tribes in the community, but the major ones are three – i.e Adara, Jaba and Katurmi. In addition there are also settlers in the community as Igbos, Yorubas, Ebira, Tiv, Idoma, Hausas and the Fulanis among others. The major religions in the area are Christianity and Islam. The women in the community are very active participants in all social, economic and educational activities. For instance there are very many women religious, social and economic organisations listed within the community. Participation of women in SBMC is not a problem in this community.
102. Key findings in the second case study include:
 - (i) SBMC exists in the school on paper, is not resourced, and is not constituted according to guidelines. PTA was the most active organisation supporting the school, but has become

- incapacitated because of the abolition of the school levy by the present government. The school is popular, for its discipline, sufficient numbers of teachers and its low cost.
- (ii) The school is a single shift with five blocks of seven classrooms. There are also the head teachers office and teachers offices attached to some classrooms. Most of these teachers offices have no furniture
 - (iii) The school has one block of three ECCD classrooms and three pit toilets – one for boys, one for girls and one for teachers.
 - (iv) Main source of water in the school is hand dug wells. The school has a football field and space for play in-between the blocks of classrooms.
 - (v) The classrooms are cemented but in bad condition. The ceilings are rotten and some of the roofs leak. There are few benches/desks in each classroom but most classes have improvised planks of wood as benches.
 - (vi) Many of the black boards are good and the classrooms have shopping corners and pot of drinking water.

School Records and Materials

103. **Records** - The school has such records as school admission register attendance register for pupils and teachers, loge book, punishment and reward books and also visitors books.
104. **Materials** - The materials available in the school include Teachers improvised teaching aids, charts, teacher's text books, exercise books and writing materials for most pupils. Very few pupils have text books and some poor ones do not have enough writing materials and exercise books. All students have school uniform although some were in poor condition.

School Population

105. **Teachers** - There are 40 teachers in the school (34 females and 6 Males). 24 teachers have NCE, 2 have diploma, 7 grades II, one H.I.S (Higher Islamic Studies, equivalent to grade II) and 6 have SSCE (Senior School Certificate Examination). The ratio of teachers to pupil 1: II. This implies very low pupil – teacher ratio – indicating that the school is over staffed.
106. **Pupils** - Total enrolment figure of pupils for current year is 449 (257 boys & 192 girls). The difference in enrolment between boys and girls is 65 in favour of boys for 2008/2009 academic session. The total enrolment for the 2007/2008 academic session was 417 pupils, of which 223 were boys and 194 were girls, showing a difference in enrolment of 29 in favour of boys. The enrolment of pupils in 2006/2007 session was 458, with boys numbering 243 and the girls 215. The difference in enrolment between boys and girls in this session was 28 in favour of boys. *The current session shows a much greater increase in number of boys in the school than the girls. The reason could not be given but it was reported that the girls generally perform better than the boys because they are more committed to school.*

Community Institutions/Associations

- The institutions identified in the community include:
- The PTA
- The all farmers association
- Ungwar mission development association
- Ungwar mission women association
- Petty traders group
- Nigerian army rehab centre
- Ex-service men association
- Nigerian union of teachers – NUT
- Local Government Education Authority – LGEA
- Local Government Council – LGC
- Ginger Association
- Humanitarian Association for women and children organisation – HAWCO
- Christian Association of Nigeria – CAN
- Jama’atul – Nasril – Islam – JNI
- Committee of Friends
- Girls brigade
- Cadet association
- Women’s Fellowship (Several by different Names)
- SBMC.

107. **Relationship** – The relationship among all the listed organization is cordial.

Organisations Supporting the School

108. Although several associations in the community were listed only very few were said to be contributing to the school development. Prominent among those contributing were the - the PTA, petty traders group within the school, LGEA, LGC, Army Rehab centre, CAN, JNI and ex-service men. Specific contributions of these organisations in school include:

- (i) PTA - identified as most supportive to the school e.g. they constructed 1 block of 2 classrooms, built 3 toilets, doors, supply chalk, monitor the school, provide writing materials and text books. In the case of damage to school roof, our finding show it’s the PTA that would shoulder the responsibility of repairs, where they are unable they refer to the LGEA or the LGC.
- (ii) The Local Government employ teachers pay their salaries through the LGEA, supply exercise books, chalk while the LGEA monitors school activities, supply chalk diaries, text books, pays teachers salaries and allowances, discipline teachers etc.
- (iii) Army Rehab centre contributed one block of 3 classrooms for ECCD and together with ex-service men who contribute in the area of security and discipline of the pupils.
- (iv) Petty traders which sell food items within the school contributed packets of chalk every term to the school on a voluntary basis.

(v) JNI and CAN jointly agree on school uniform and ensure peace in the community. The JNI provides Islamic teachers to the school.

109. Most of the other organizations identified which do not give direct support to the school, however they said their support to the school is as individual parents through PTA. Some of them said the school or the PTA has never approached them in their capacity as organizations to support school projects. *This seems to be an opportunity that SBMCs could explore in resource mobilization for school development.*

Reading and Writing

110. **Pupils' ability to read/Write** - All the respondents agreed that in case of a child's inability to read in Primary 6, the teacher, the child and the parents are to be blamed. Reasons given included: teachers – poor method of teaching, lack of warm and friendly attitude and monitoring of the child's progress. Pupils – laziness, lack of interest and inattentiveness to school work and the parents, it's non – provision of text books and learning materials, leaving the child hungry and poor monitoring of the child's progress in schools.

Resources

Financial and other Materials Resources

111. SBMC established in the school but is not yet functioning, due lack of financial and material resources among other factors. This finding disproves the claim of participants at the State and LGEA levels who said SBMC was functional in all schools within Kaduna.

Skills and Capacity

112. SBMC members lack the knowledge and the understanding of the concept of SBMC, its purpose and objectives and their roles and responsibilities. The committee does not have relevant materials and documents on SBMC.

113. Based on the above, therefore, the team's view is that SBMC requires capacity building in the following areas:

- Sensitization and awareness creation
- training on school development planning (SDP)
- Advocacy and Resource mobilization
- Financial Management
- Record keeping
- SBMC Roles and Responsibilities
- School Budgeting
- Leadership training
- School monitoring
- networking and
- Community participation, ownership and sustainability

Training and Support

114. SBMC has not had any form of training and support. There hasn't been any other intervention in the school.

Networks

115. Though SBMC is not functioning in the school, the school and PTA through networking with other UNICEF schools were able to establish the ECCD programme in the school. The army rehab authority donated a block of three classrooms for the ECCD.

Motivation & Reward

116. This was not applicable because no functional SBMC, however, the school keeps records of rewards for pupils.

Inclusivity

Membership

117. The SBMC list contains 19 members spread according to the guidelines with women and children represented. The persons on the list are as follows: SBMC chair is the RSM of the army rehab centre; the H/Teacher is the secretary. There are 2 representatives of PTA (1m and 1f), two representatives of pupils (H/Boy and H/Girl). There are 2 representatives of old boys (1male and 1 female) and two artisan representatives, (1 male and 1 female). The faith based organizations are represented by 1 reverend and 1 imam while the youth are represented by 1 person (Male). There are two community representatives (1 male and 1 female). There is one woman, representing the women group. There are 2 teachers, (1 male and 1 female).

Process of formation

118. In response to a circular from LGEA, members were selected based on guidelines by the head teacher and sent to the LGEA without those selected been informed or their consent sought since 2005.

Role of Women, the Poor, Children

119. The SBMC members, including women, the poor and children expressed their eagerness to participate in SBMC but since it's not yet functioning, its purpose and expected their roles and responsibilities is unclear to them. Thus sections 4.3 to 4.5 were not applicable.

Communication

Profile and presence of SBMC

120. **Profile** - Policy on establishment – information on the establishment of SBMC came to the H/teacher through the LGEA. Even the teachers in the school did not know of SBMC existence in the school.

121. **Presence of SBMC** - Presence of SBMC is not yet felt in the school and the community. However, through awareness created by our visit, school/community members have welcomed SBMC and have shown through the Venn diagram and exercises conducted that SBMC has good prospect of improving school management through effective community participation in school. For example, during a Venn

diagram with Fathers, a large circle was used to represent SBMC after understanding its aim/objectives, roles and responsibilities as explained by the research team.

Communication with community, school and LGEA

122. LGEA communicated to the school on the establishment of SBMC and the school complied and sent list of members to the LGEA through report. The formation of the SBMC was not communicated to members of the school and community. However, list of members was contained in the handing over notes to the present H/T. First SBMC meeting held on 27/3/09 with 11 members in attendance according to the minutes. *(This appears to have been a hurried meeting perhaps in preparation for the research team's visit)*

Tension and conflict

123. There is cordial relationship among organizations in the community despite the numerous tribes inhabiting the place. During the feedback meeting a community member asked some questions:

- Is SBMC is designed to overthrow PTA?
- Is SBMC going to maintain an independent account or a joint account with PTA?
- Can SBMC call for a meeting of the community?

These questions were thoroughly clarified by the team in order to avoid potential areas of conflicts in future.

Influence

124. In the case of this section, the Kaduna 1 School seem to be doing averagely better because it enjoys support of the army. The discipline and order as well as the adequacy of teachers in the school coupled with its low cost serves as an attraction to parents who send their children to this school even from afar off. One primary five pupil said, 'I was brought to this school because it is cheaper and they have many teachers'. In fact he described the school as for the 'talakawas'ie the poor. Besides, the PTA of the school is also very supportive. Being headed by an ex soldier parent, he works with zeal with his exco for improvement in the school.

125. The acceptability of SBMC by the community:

- There is unity and peace in the community
- Women and children are very eager to participate and contribute to the development the school
- Associations and organization are willing to make contribution as groups to the educational development of the school.

Improving education

126. Since SBMC is not functional, the benefits of PTA activities in the school as explained by participants include:

- (i) Learning environment of the school is made more conducive, with toilets and repairs of blown off roofs.

- (ii) Provision of text and learning materials has contributed to improved teaching/learning and quality of education
- (iii) Additional classrooms under construction by PTA will reduce congestion in classes and enhance effective teaching.
- (iv) Availability of portable drinking water made possible by PTA contributes to preventable water borne diseases.

Discussion & analysis

127. This section is based on a series of statements developed by the research team (in bold). The response to the statements reflects the extent to which Kaduna cases support or contradict the statements, in order to avoid the pitfall of generalising from the case studies.

PTA Status

128. **The abolition of the PTA levy (in 4 of the states) has led to a decline in activity of PTAs, a shortage of funding at school level and pressure on SBMC members to dig into their own pockets.** This statement is true of the two case studies in Kaduna State, e.g. Kaduna 2 LGEA primary school, Zaria, where the PTA was very active and described as *“the all in all”* organisation that support the school. However, it is now reduced to giving advice to SBMC which has received grant from the SESP project. Before the grant SBMC at Kaduna 2 LGEA primary school assisted the school only through contribution by individual members. At the second LGA of research – Kachia, SBMC members have no funding to do anything and as such are inactive. Unfortunately, the once active PTA in the same school has gone into limbo without funds to even complete the two class room block they had started.

SBMC Policy

129. **Inadequately conceptualised and articulated SBMC policy has resulted in lack of clarity in roles, relationships, communication and management among stakeholders (PTA’s government structures, development partners and civil society groups). The existence of many versions of policy guidelines and the absence in some cases has contributed to variations in SBMC composition, decision making process as well as the selection process of its membership.** The roles of SBMC members are not adequately comprehended in LGEA Kaduna 2, Zaria even though they have the guidelines and have enjoyed some training on their roles and responsibilities. Composition of SBMC membership in Kaduna 2 LGEA Primary school Zaria was not done as stipulated in the guidelines. For instance the membership of NGO on the SBMC was not clear. The situation was worse in Kachia where even the guidelines were not available and SBMC composition was done single handily by the immediate past Head teacher. Those who were members of SBMC themselves did not know they were members. The SBMC chairman said “I don’t know any other member of the SBMC, I myself was told in a meeting a few days ago that am the SBMC Chairman’. All members of the SBMC including the education secretary saw the SBMC guidelines from the researchers. In the words of the head teacher, ‘I have not seen the SBMC guidelines’. **Composition of SBMC’s in clusters in some cases with unclear motives and benefits as**

this limits awareness of SBMC's in cluster schools. The case studies in Kaduna State did not operate the Cluster SBMC system.

130. **Expected roles of SBMC as articulated in the policy guidelines require a minimum capacity, hence an implication for current SBMC composition.** The SBMC members in the Pam –madina LGEA primary school have had some training on their roles and responsibilities, school planning etc but the current composition of SBMC does not have the effectively carry out their work. For instance, the roles of monitoring and evaluation, advocacy, resource mobilisation etc can be more effectively carried out with a minimum level of education. No wonder, the Director of PRS at SUBEB observed that ‘educated people who would have helped the SBMC implementation better are all living in town’. Clearly this means people with varied knowledge and skills mix need to be included in SBMC.

SBMC implementation

131. **SBMC activities include checking truancy among pupils and teachers and encouraging pupils' learning via incentives: biscuits, writing materials. SBMC's have the power to effect substantial change.** Particularly in Kaduna 2 LGEA school in Zaria, SBMC members do help to check truancy among students and robbery of school property. A few members assist pupils with writing materials and birth certificate forms as incentives for good performance among pupils in Zaria school. SBMC showed capacity to effect change when they stopped selling in the school premises by young female children demanding instead that they should be in school (Pam- madina LGEA primary school, Zaria). Kachia SBMC has not started work in the school/community.
132. **The formation of the SBMC reduces the amount of representation by community members, most especially for residents who are 'foreigners'. It tends to favour the elite.** As seen in the schools visited, SBMCs membership does not lean towards the elite but it definitely excludes foreigners especially in Kaduna 2 LGEA primary school, Zaria. But for Kachia Kaduna 1 school, foreigners are not exempted as the chairman of SBMC is not an indigenous person but from the southern part of Nigeria. Perhaps he was chosen as because he is the commandant of the army rehab centre.
133. **SBMC members are usually selected according to variable criteria that tend to favour elite/prominent individuals. SBMC members hope to gain power and status from their positions.** Through a community meeting, SBMC members at Kaduna 2 school, Zaria were selected on the basis of trust worthiness, hard work and commitment to duty. In Pam –madina LGEA School, SMBC members acknowledged that they gain recognition and respect from the community due to their work in school. SBMC chair in Kaduna 2 primary school claimed he was appointed the health district chairman of health committee due to recognition of his hard work as SBMC Chair. “It was in recognition of my role as SBMC chair that I was appointed as the district health committee chair”, interview with SBMC Chair. SBMC members in Kachia Kaduna 1 school had no experience to share.
134. **SBMCs have no financial resources, i.e. Lack of funding and financial support for SBMC.** SBMC at Kaduna 2 primary school is funded through SESP grant. Before the grant individual members taxed themselves to assist the school. For example, the members said they taxed with the assistance of

the PTA to open an account preparatory for the SESP grant. There isn't any form of funding for SBMC at Kaduna 1 school Kachia.

Governance

135. **Most community members are unaware about what SBMC is and its activities.**

In Kaduna 2 Primary school Zaria, Some of the teachers, Pupils and community members including women knew very little about SBMC in the school. The recent development projects made possible by SESP grant in Kaduna 2 school helped to advertise the presence of SBMC in the school. For example, the community members and even some members of the SBMC did not know the amount of the grant received for school development.

136. At Kaduna 1 school, Kachia, SBMC members had not seen the guidelines not to talk of knowing their roles & responsibilities. In fact since their names were compiled by the head teacher without their knowledge, they were called to a meeting for the first time at the instance of the research team's arrival. This is contrary to the information received at the MOE, SUBEB and LGEA where we were told that SBMC is present and active in all schools within Kaduna State.

137. **SBMCs are seen as an instrument of the state, accountable to government rather than community.**

In both schools of study SBMCs are recognised as a structure set up by government to assist the welfare of the schools. However, community members did not show clear understanding of who SBMC should be accountable to in at Pam –madina school Zaria. Some participants said SBMC should be accountable to the PTA or the School. Others reasoned that they should be accountable to the community or LGEA who set it up. For Kachia Kaduna 1 school, all participants felt SBMC should be accountable to the government. In his view, 'the SBMC is accountable to the government because they set it up and not school or community', (SBMC chairman, Kachia).

138. **There is very poor flow of information from communities and schools upwards.**

Contrary to the opinion of the head teacher, the SBMC chair and the PRO, information flow is generally poor both vertically and horizontally in KADUNA 2 primary school. This is evident in poor knowledge of SBMCs and her expected roles and responsibilities among the community members, teachers and even the pupils. Although the SBMC desk Officer from the LGEA was with the team throughout the exercise, it was obvious that there was a gap in the monitoring of the SBMC from the LGEA as expected.

139. At the level of the school and community, SBMC was not known before the team's visit at Kachia Kaduna 1 school.

140. **LGEA and state government are keen to influence SBMCs.**

This statement is true looking at the structure of the SBMC. State MOE, SUBEB and LGEA have SBMC desk officers. At SUBEB, there is a PRO officer directly responsible for working with SBMCs in schools. However, unlike the PTA, there is no corresponding community structure at the State and LGEA levels to support SBMC activities as is the case with PTA.

Community and context

- 141. There are various associations, networks and individuals contributing to school development. Some of them currently work in isolation of SBMC out of ignorance of its existence. Nigeria is large and diverse and the issues in SBMC implementation vary with context.**

In both case studies various associations and individuals were listed in the communities, few of which were contributing to school development of both case studies. In Kachia Kaduna 1 school, prominent associations as the PTAs LGEA/LGA, Army rehab group and petty traders group in school were identified as contributing to school development. Others included old boys, Individual community members and honourable councillors. However, most of the associations confessed to not helping the school as associations but only through PTA as individual members. Their reason was they have not been invited as associations to help in the schools. One woman said, “if the school invites us to contribute to school development as association, we shall help but as of now they have not.’ This implies advocacy and resource mobilisation and awareness creation is vital for the sustainability of SBMC.

142. The case at Kaduna 2 was quite different. While some respondents said some associations were giving support to the school, no single association confirmed this. The old boys claimed to have been supporting the school were not visibly there. However, there was abundant evidence proving the support of the female mallamais’ to the community.

Other interventions

- 143. Organisations rooted in the community make contributions that may have more sustainable effect, e.g. Islamiya Schools.**

This was not the case in Kaduna school/community case studies. However, this could be case in other communities in Kaduna State.

- 144. Contributions from local ‘big men’ on the other hand make a big impression on the minds of community members out of all proportion to the benefits gained, and may disempower communities. Commercial companies also donate large sums and use this as an opportunity to advertise products which may have negative effects on both.**

This was not applicable in both Kaduna case studies.

- 145. Interventions at school, community or Government level have brought about some changes in schools but changes in Government policy along with posting of teachers away from the target community have brought project sustainability into question. SBMC’s are more active in GEP and SESP schools.** Other projects in Pam - madina LGEA School Zaria were completed VIP toilets and ongoing bore hole by the Millennium development goal (MDG) project in Nigeria. This project though useful was kind of imposed on the school/community since they protested and asked for additional class room blocks instead. *Interventions that do not consider community input tend not to be well appreciated, owned and maintained.*

Children and Women in SBMC

146. **Even though the SBMC guidance notes emphasises children’s membership in the SBMC, in most school communities, children are not recognised as having any key role to play in the SBMC. In most school/communities, women’s role and participation in the SBMC appears to be constrained by many factors.**
147. Participation of women in SBMC is limited especially in the northern part of the state due to cultural and religious hindrances on women. For example at Pam – madina, the women who numbered seven on the SBMC list had never attended the meeting by the account. The issue of children participation was clearly not popular in the both the southern and northern parts of the State. At best their membership was on paper.
148. Participation of women at Kaduna 1 school Kachia, the southern part of Kaduna which is dominated by Christians was not a problem. In-fact the women seem more active in matters of the school than the men. During the community feed back meeting at Kachia, one man said, ‘15 years ago women have taken over the leadership of the homes in Kachia LGA’. This statement implied the dominant role of women as opposed to the men who were poorly committed to the school progress.

Teaching and Learning

149. **Standards of teaching and learning and availability of instructional materials are so inadequate that SBMC alone cannot realistically provide adequate solutions.** Recent intervention in Kaduna 2 LGEA Primary school has made available instructional materials and teaching aids in the school. In spite of this standards of teaching and learning still leaves much to be desired and SBMC is ill-equipped to handle this. Most of the children in primary 5 and 6 cannot read and write in English or even Hausa. The situation is pretty similar in Kaduna 1 school, Rehab Centre, Kachia. However, primary 5 and 6 pupils can read and write in the case of Kachia, although writing and teaching materials are inadequate. They also have sufficient numbers of teachers in this school.