Education Sector Support Programme in Nigeria (ESSPIN)

Assignment Report

SBMCs in Policy and Practice: Lagos State Report

Report Number LG 401

Jane Hughes

April 2009
Report Distribution and Revision Sheet

Project Name: Education Sector Support Programme in Nigeria

Report Title: SMBCs in Policy and Practice: Lagos State Report

Report No: LG 401

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rev No*</th>
<th>Date of issue</th>
<th>Originators</th>
<th>Checker</th>
<th>Approver</th>
<th>Scope of checking</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>September 2009</td>
<td>Jane Hughes</td>
<td>Aboki Fatima</td>
<td>Steve Baines</td>
<td>Formatting/Content</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Distribution List

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Position</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>DFID</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kathleen Richmond</td>
<td>Human Development Programme Coordinator, DFID</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ian Attfield</td>
<td>Education Adviser, DFID Northern Nigeria Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roseline Onyemachi</td>
<td>Education Project Officer, DFID</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>ESSPIN</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John Martin</td>
<td>National Programme Manager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ron Tuck</td>
<td>Deputy Programme Manager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Richard Hanson</td>
<td>Assistant Programme Manager</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steve Baines</td>
<td>Technical Team Coordinator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abolaji Osime</td>
<td>State Team Leader Lagos</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emma Williams</td>
<td>State Team Leader Kwara</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Richard Dalgarno</td>
<td>State Team Leader Kano</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Steve Bradley</td>
<td>State Team Leader Kaduna</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kayode Sanni</td>
<td>State Team Leader Jigawa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>John Kay</td>
<td>Lead Specialist, Education Quality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alero Ayida-Otobo</td>
<td>Lead Specialist, Policy and Planning -Federal Level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fatima Aboki</td>
<td>Lead Specialist, Community Interaction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nguyen Feese</td>
<td>Lead Specialist, Inst. Development and Education Mgt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Francis Watkins</td>
<td>Lead Specialist, Social Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Penny Holden</td>
<td>Lead Specialist, Inspectorates</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Quality Assurance Sheet and Disclaimer

“This document has been prepared for the titled project or named part thereof and should not be relied on or used for any other project without an independent check being carried out as to its suitability and prior written authority of Cambridge Education Ltd. (CE) being obtained. Cambridge Education Ltd. accepts no responsibility or liability for the consequences of this document being used for a purpose other than the purpose for which it was commissioned. Any person using or relying on the document for such other purposes agrees, and will by such use and reliance be taken to confirm his agreement to indemnify Cambridge Education Ltd. for all loss and damage resulting there from. Cambridge Education Ltd. accepts no responsibility or liability for this document to any party other than the person by whom it was commissioned."

"To the extent that this report is based on information supplied by other parties, Cambridge Education Ltd. accepts no liability for any loss or damage suffered by the client, whether contractual or tortuous, stemming from any conclusions based on data supplied by parties other than Cambridge Education Ltd. and used by Cambridge Education Ltd. in preparing this report."
Note on Documentary Series

This document is one of the series to be produced by Cambridge Education Consultants in support of their contract with the Department for International Development for the Education Sector Support Programme in Nigeria.

The documents include:

ESSPIN 001 ESSPIN 1st Quarterly Report
ESSPIN 002 MTSS Strategy
ESSPIN 003 M&E Strategy
ESSPIN 004 Inception Strategy
ESSPIN 005 Report Re-assigned ESSPIN 204
ESSPIN 006 ESSPIN 3rd Quarterly Report
ESSPIN 007 Report Re-assigned ESSPIN 205
ESSPIN 008 National Consultant Capacity Building Programme
ESSPIN 009 Report Reassigned ESSPIN 206
ESSPIN 010 Institutional Development, Public Finance Management – Scoping Visit
ESSPIN 011 Development of State – level Logframe for Kano and Jigawa States
ESSPIN 012 School Case Study Reports – Kaduna, Kano & Kwara States
ESSPIN 013 ESSPIN 4th Quarterly Report

ESSPIN 201 Analysis of the Role of LGAs and LGEAs in Supporting Basic Education in Nigeria, December 08
ESSPIN 202 MTSS preparation in Jigawa, Kaduna and Kano State: Planning Task Specialist Visit 1
ESSPIN 203 Analysis of the Role of LGAs and LGEAs in supporting basic education in Nigeria, May 09
ESSPIN 204 Initial Report from the MTSS Task Team Leader
ESSPIN 205 Support to completion of MTSS in Lagos and Kwara States: Finance Task Specialist Visit 1
ESSPIN 206 Service to support the completion of MTSS in Lagos State: Task Team Leader Visit 2
ESSPIN 207 Further Support to the Completion of MTSS in Lagos & Kwara states: Task Team Leader Visit 3
ESSPIN 208 Progress Report on the MTSS Preparation in Jigawa, Kaduna and Kano: Planning Task Specialist Visit 2
ESSPIN 209 Support to the completion of Medium-term Sector Strategy (MTSS) for Jigawa, Kaduna and Kano: Finance Task Specialist Visit 1
ESSPIN 210 Support to the completion of Medium-term Sector Strategy (MTSS) for Jigawa, Kaduna and Kano: Finance Task Specialist Visit 2
ESSPIN 211 Services to support the completion of Medium–term Sector Strategies (MTSS) in Lagos & Kwara states: Task Team Leader Visit 4
<p>| ESSPIN 212 | Support to the Completion of Medium-term Sector Strategy (MTSS) for Jigawa, Kaduna and Kano: Finance Task Specialist Visit 3, May 09 |
| ESSPIN 213 | Services to support the completion of Medium-term Sector Strategies (MTSS) in Lagos &amp; Kwara states: Task Team Leader Visit 5 |
| ESSPIN 214 | Support to the Completion of Medium-term Sector Strategy (MTSS) for Jigawa, Kaduna and Kano: Finance Task Specialist Visit 4, June 09 |
| ESSPIN 215 | Support to the Completion of Medium-term Sector Strategy (MTSS) in Lagos and Kwara: International Finance Task specialist Visit 2 July 09 |
| ESSPIN 216 | Progress Report on the MTSS Preparation in Jigawa, Kaduna and Kano: Planning Task Specialist Visit 3 July 09 |
| ESSPIN 217 | Support to the Completion of Medium-term Sector Strategy in Lagos and Kwara: National Finance Task Specialist Visit 1 – 3 |
| ESSPIN 301 | Teaching and Learning Survey |
| ESSPIN 302 | School Infrastructures and Maintenance Review for ESSPIN States |
| ESSPIN 303 | Preparation for the Main Teaching and Learning Survey, May 2009 |
| ESSPIN 401 | School Based Management Committees Research February 09 |
| ESSPIN 402 | School Based Management Committees Research March 09 |
| ESSPIN 403 | IQTE integration work in Kano, Kaduna and Jigawa: Task Specialist Visit Reports 1 - 4 |
| ESSPIN 501 | Communications and Knowledge Management Strategy |
| ESSPIN 502 | Communication Task Specialist Visit Report, December 08 |
| ESSPIN 503 | Education Management Information Systems (EMIS) - Scoping Mission |
| ESSPIN 504 | Communication Task Specialist Visit Report, February 09 |
| ESSPIN 505 | Report on Scoping Visit to Develop BBCWST Communications Strategy for ESSPIN |
| ESSPIN 506 | Education Management Information Systems (EMIS) May 09 |
| ESSPIN 507 | Communications Task Specialist Visit Report, April/May 09 |
| ESSPIN 508 | Knowledge Management Task Specialist Support Visit Report, Mar/April 09 |
| ESSPIN 509 | ICT Strategy Draft Report, April 09 |
| ESSPIN 510 | ICT Strategy Implementation Plan Draft Report April 09 |
| ESSPIN 511 | Development of ESSPIN Programme and Management Information Communication System |
| ESSPIN 512 | Knowledge Management Support Visit Report, Oct 08 |
| ESSPIN 513 | Mapping ESSPIN Research Strategy, April 09 |
| ESSPIN 514 | Education Management Information Systems: Fourth Visit Report, June 09 |
| ESSPIN 515 | Task Specialist Support Communication Visit Report, June 09 |
| ESSPIN 516 | Monitoring and Evaluation Inception Phase Visit Reports 1 – 4 |
| JG 301 | An Assessment of Teacher Education in Jigawa State: Task Specialists Visit 1 |
| JG 302 | An Assessment of Teacher Education in Jigawa State: Task Specialists Visit 2 |
| JG 401 | SMBCs in Policy and Practice: Jigawa state Report |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>KD 301</td>
<td>Institutional Analysis of Teacher Education Structures in Kaduna State with Particular Focus on Gidan Waya College of Education: Task Specialists Visit 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KD 302</td>
<td>Institutional Analysis of Teacher Education Structures in Kaduna State with Particular Focus on Gidan Waya College of Education: Task Specialists Visit 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KD 401</td>
<td>SMBCs in Policy and Practice: Kaduna State State Report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KN 301</td>
<td>Education Institutional Development: Teacher Education Strategy for Kano State, Task Specialists Visit 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KN 302</td>
<td>Education Institutional Development: Teacher Education Strategy for Kano State, Task Specialists Visit 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KN 401</td>
<td>IQTEB Proposal for the Approval of Kano State Government, Jun 09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KN 402</td>
<td>SMBCs in Policy and Practice: Kano State Report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KW 301</td>
<td>An Assessment of the Development needs of Teachers in Nigeria – Kwara State Case Study</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KW 302</td>
<td>Oro College Review of Strategic Priorities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KW 303</td>
<td>Curriculum Transformation for College of Education Oro</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KW 304</td>
<td>Towards a Transformed Pre-Service Teacher Education Curriculum for College of Education Oro</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KW 305</td>
<td>Institutional Strengthening of Oro College</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KW 306</td>
<td>Teacher Strategy; Improving the Teaching of Literacy and Numeracy: Scoping visit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KW 307</td>
<td>Institutional Strengthening at Oro College and Teacher Development Strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KW 308</td>
<td>Curriculum Transformation at Kwara State College of Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KW 401</td>
<td>Functional and Training Needs Assessment of DSM (UBEC and SUBEB) Consultancy Report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KW 402</td>
<td>SMBCs in Policy and Practice: Kwara State Report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LG 401</td>
<td>SMBCs in Policy and Practice: Lagos State Report</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Contents

Report Distribution and Revision Sheet ................................................................. ii
Quality Assurance Sheet and Disclaimer .............................................................. iii
Note on Documentary Series ................................................................................. iv
Acronyms and Abbreviations ................................................................................... viii
Introduction .......................................................................................................... 1
  Background ........................................................................................................... 1
  Lagos State ........................................................................................................... 3
  Education and SBMCs in Lagos .......................................................................... 3
State level findings .................................................................................................. 5
  Introduction ......................................................................................................... 5
  Resources ............................................................................................................ 6
  Inclusivity ............................................................................................................ 6
  Communication ................................................................................................... 6
  Influence ............................................................................................................. 7
LGA level findings ................................................................................................... 9
  Background ......................................................................................................... 9
  Resources ........................................................................................................... 10
  Inclusivity .......................................................................................................... 10
  Communication .................................................................................................. 11
  Influence ............................................................................................................ 12
Lagos 1 School and Community .......................................................................... 12
  Background ......................................................................................................... 12
  Resources .......................................................................................................... 14
  Inclusivity .......................................................................................................... 15
  Communication .................................................................................................. 16
  Influence ............................................................................................................ 17
  Improving education ......................................................................................... 19
Lagos 2 School and Community .......................................................................... 20
  Background ......................................................................................................... 20
  Resources .......................................................................................................... 22
  Inclusivity .......................................................................................................... 24
  Communication .................................................................................................. 25
  Influence ............................................................................................................ 27
  Improving education ......................................................................................... 27
Discussion & analysis ........................................................................................... 28
  PTAs ................................................................................................................... 28
  SBMC Policy ...................................................................................................... 29
  SBMC Implementation ....................................................................................... 30
  Governance ......................................................................................................... 31
  Community and context ..................................................................................... 31
  Other interventions ............................................................................................ 32
  Inclusion ............................................................................................................. 32
  Teaching and Learning ....................................................................................... 33
## Acronyms and Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DFID</td>
<td>Department for International Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESP</td>
<td>Education Sector Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EPSSim</td>
<td>Education Policy and Strategy Simulation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESSPIN</td>
<td>Education Sector Support in Nigeria</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GEP</td>
<td>Girl Education Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HT</td>
<td>Head Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LGEA</td>
<td>Local Government Education Authority’s</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M&amp;E</td>
<td>Monitoring and Evaluation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MDA</td>
<td>Ministry, Departments and Agencies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEPB</td>
<td>Ministry of Economic Planning and Budget</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOE</td>
<td>Ministry of Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOF</td>
<td>Ministry of Finance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOEST</td>
<td>Ministry of Education, Science and Technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MTSS</td>
<td>Medium-term Sector Strategies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NEEDS</td>
<td>National Economic Empowerment and Development Strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTA</td>
<td>Parents, Teachers Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SDP</td>
<td>School Development Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEEDS</td>
<td>State Economic Empowerment and Development Strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMBC</td>
<td>School Based Management Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STL</td>
<td>State Team Leader</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SUBEB</td>
<td>State Universal Basic Education Board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TNA</td>
<td>Training Need Analysis</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOR</td>
<td>Terms of Reference</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Abstract

1. This is a report of research conducted in March – April 2009 which sought to explore the implications of SBMC policy, with particular focus on questions of gender, poverty and school governance through case studies of selected schools and communities as well as interviews at the Local Government Education Authority (LGEA) levels. In Lagos State, the research was conducted in three stages – interviews of State and LGEA level stakeholders, participant observation and semi structured interviews in sample schools and communities, and giving reports to Government and PTA stakeholders interviewed during the first stage.

Introduction

Background

2. Research was conducted in three stages. The first week was devoted to interviews of State and LGEA level stakeholders who were interviewed from 17 to 20 March 2009. The second week, from 23 March to 27 March 2009 consisted of participant observation and semi structured interviews in a school and community in Lagos 1, on the outskirts of Lagos. During this week initial contact was made with a second community, Lagos 2, nearer in to the centre of Lagos, where intensive research took place from 30 March to 3 April 2009. The final 2 days of the exercise were devoted to giving reports to Government and PTA stakeholders interviewed during the first week. The research team consisted of one researcher, Mrs Jane Hughes, one ESSPIN Access and Equity expert, Mr Abiodun Fowomola, one research assistant, Mrs Tina Obanobi-Adeoba of FELTIN Consultancy, Lagos, and one Social Mobilisation Officer from Alimosho LGEA, Mrs Rachael Olafajo.

3. The Social Mobilisation Officer was also a key stakeholder since she was the person in the LGEA responsible for setting up and supervising SBMCs in Alimosho. She was interviewed on 17 and 18 March and was then briefed on the nature of the research. Based on these informal interviews she was able to put the research team in contact with key stakeholders for interview. She also selected two schools in the LGEA that were rooted in their local communities. Many children in Lagos do not attend schools within their communities, and many schools are on main roads and not directly in contact with local communities. Lagos presents a unique situation in Nigeria and without Mrs Olafajo’s help the exercise would have been ineffective. The Mobilisation Officer introduced the team to the Chairman of Lagos State Universal Basic Education Board (SUBEB) and explained the nature of research. Based on this information, the Chairman set up two interviews for Friday 20 March. She suggested that instead of interviewing the DPRS as planned, the team should meet the engineer in charge of implementing all primary school projects in the State, and this interview showed how the physical proximity of schools, often sharing
one compound, toilets and common walls, made the recommended pattern of SBMCs inappropriate in Lagos.

4. A very valuable interview was set up with two officers jointly. These were the outgoing Director of Mobilisation in SUBEB and his replacement who was still in the process of being posted. From this interview the research team gained a lot of knowledge and understanding as to how Lagos State implemented the introduction of SBMCs, along with other details of the social and economic situation in the State. The final interview at State level was with a member of the State PTA Committee. It proved impossible to meet the Chair, but the officer interviewed was also the Chair of Alimosho PTA Committee, and had been in that post for over ten years. His extensive knowledge of Lagos proved a very helpful starting point for the research.

5. At Local Government level the interview with the Mobilisation Officer was the most helpful, and an interview with her deputy threw further light on the situation. The Education Secretary gave every assistance in the organisation of the research. He himself took time out of a meeting to be interviewed by the research team.

6. In the two communities researched on the second and third weeks of the exercise, the same pattern was followed for each. At community level semi-structured interviews were conducted with the Chairman of the SBMC, the Community Leader and a Women's Leader. Focus Group Discussions took place with SBMC members, Mothers of children in the school and Fathers of children in the school. Social and resource mapping was done in the community, and in each case the researchers took a transect walk through the community, chatting informally with anyone they met.

7. At school level there were semi-structured interviews with the Head Teacher and one female teacher who was not a member of the SBMC. Three boys and three girls were interviewed in each school and played a specially designed game that involved picking up cards with questions about the SBMC and the school. Their answers were recorded. In each school the researchers conducted a survey of the buildings, office records, SBMC minutes, school population and number of children in two of the classes compared with the record on the register. They also checked the teaching and achievement levels in the top classes, known in Lagos as Basic 6.

8. In each community the information received was summarised and fed back to the community using both flip-charts and a typed report. The community's responses to the feedback were noted.

9. A summary report on the research was typed and given to both the Education Secretary of the LGEA and the Chairman of SUBEB. A copy was also given to the State PTA Committee.
Lagos State

10. Lagos adjoins the Yoruba-speaking States of the former Western Region of Nigeria from which many of its inhabitants originate. Their thinking often appears to be influenced by that Region’s policy under the late Chief Awolowo of free education for all. The language of Lagos is a dialect of Yoruba. Nearly everyone encountered during the research also spoke fluent English.

11. Lagos is not like the adjoining States. In spite of its small area its population is huge. People live densely packed and occupation of ten people to one room is not uncommon. In spite of its mangrove-swamps, Lagos is mostly urban. It is constantly expanding and the town now extends to the north beyond the State borders.

12. Its history is unique. Lagos was under British protection before Nigeria as a whole became a colony. In the mid nineteenth century it was already a well established trading post. The sheltered waters of Lagos Lagoon provided one of the few natural harbours on the coast of West Africa and it had long been a centre of the Atlantic slave trade. Lagos Island has a ‘Brazilian Quarter’. Surnames including Santana, Pereira and Silva exist among the descendants of former slave traders and returned slaves from Brazil. There are also Lagosians whose ancestors were of Sierra Leonean, Ghanaian and West Indian origin, brought in as clerks by colonial and business administrators.

13. Western education was long ago established in Lagos – one Roman Catholic Mission school celebrated its centenary in 1973. Before the end of the nineteenth century there were Lagosians who had become medical doctors.

14. Lagos was the capital of Nigeria for many years. People from all over Nigeria and beyond settled there. In 1976 the Federal Government announced that the capital would be moved to the centre of Nigeria and during the 21st century Abuja has become established as the seat of government. Lagos remains the commercial capital of the nation.

Yoruba Culture in Lagos

15. About 75% of the children in the sample schools were Yoruba. Government recognises the traditional Yoruba system of government. The highest rank is Oba, loosely translated as King. He is selected from one of the royal families and receives a government salary. There are also lesser chiefs known as Baale, or Head. Lagos 2 had an Oba with a large palace. In Lagos 1, the community leader was known as the Baale.

Education and SBMCs in Lagos

Clusters of schools forming SBMCs

16. In Lagos all Government primary and junior secondary schools in a neighbourhood have just one SBMC. This means that each SBMC has about ten schools as members. According to officers in Lagos State Universal Basic Education Board (SUBEB), the huge
size of Lagos, with as many as ten schools on one compound, made it difficult for each school to have a separate SBMC.

17. In Alimosho LGA the groups of schools forming an SBMC are called Clusters. Clusters are still being adjusted to coincide with communities, which are difficult to identify precisely.

‘Landlords’ in Lagos

18. Alimosho LGA alone has 58 government primary schools. There are 20 LGAs in Lagos State. Lagos has a constant influx of population. There are also people who have lived there for generations and consider themselves the ‘landlords’, known as Awori. They are able to live on rents they collect from land and property. Awori do not need to struggle to survive in Lagos in the same way that newcomers do. This can lead to complacency about their children’s education. If they have never needed to work themselves they may not realise that Lagos is now so crowded that there is very little new land to give out, and their children may find that their traditional family property is not big enough to divide up among a large number of children. Those children may need to fend for themselves in the future.

PTA and SBMC in Lagos State

19. In 2007 a new Governor was elected in Lagos with an agenda of free education. One issue that had long been controversial in the State was the levies imposed by PTAs. There was a compulsory annual PTA levy of N300 which was affordable to most people but was perceived as a lot of money and resented because children were driven out of school for non-payment. In addition to the N300 there were unpredictable extra levies for special projects.

Quality of education and the issue of private schools in Lagos State

20. Parents have concerns around the quality of education. There are many private schools of varying quality in Lagos. When poorer people perceived levies in Government schools to be too high, they began to look towards putting their children in private schools. Parents resent making any payments to government schools for PTA, books or uniform and some say that if they are to pay anything they would prefer to spend it in a private school where they know what they are getting (Lagos 2 transect, 3b).

21. There is a belief that private schools are best; this is not always true and government schools have better qualified teachers. Private schools drive children out if fees are not paid; parents with no consistent income may move their children to a private school and then have to move them back to Government schools when they run out of money, doubly disrupting children’s education.

22. In the light of tensions about money the Governor abolished all PTA levies at around the same time that SBMCs were introduced. This led to a serious problem. Because Government provided insufficient money for day to day running of schools, so PTA
assistance had become essential. SBMCs have no source of income so they cannot take over the role formerly played by PTAs.

Abolition of PTA levies understood as abolition of PTA

23. PTAs have existed for many years and are familiar to the people. They are easily understood, being identified as associations of the parents and teachers of a particular school. Tension is apparent about current developments with PTAs.

24. SBMCs include several schools and while the ideal is for the SBMC to be rooted in the community served by these schools, this is not always the case. Schools do not necessarily represent single communities. In a large city like Lagos, neighbourhoods may not coincide with communities, or children in one community may go to schools in different communities, even in other parts of Lagos.

State level findings

Introduction

25. Four people were interviewed. Three of them were in SUBEB and the fourth was a member of the State level PTA committee.

SUBEB interviews

26. The SUBEB Chairperson was extremely helpful in arranging the interviews. These included a joint interview with the outgoing Director of Social Mobilisation, who had already been posted to Ministry of Education HQ, and his replacement who had not yet been officially posted (although the posting was accomplished before the end of the research exercise).

27. The second interview was with the engineer in charge of projects for schools. The research team had initially asked to see the Director of Planning Research and Statistics. The engineer was suggested as a more suitable person to interview as he was the person directly involved in implementing all projects concerning physical facilities in Lagos State schools.

Key information given: Social Mobilisation

28. The interview with the outgoing Director of Social Mobilisation and the new Director replacing him, provided a great deal of information. The outgoing Director had started in the post shortly before SBMCs were introduced in Lagos State and therefore he was able to give the full history of how they were planned. The man replacing him was also very well-informed on projects, having been in charge of all UNICEF programmes in the State.
Resources

Free education and the abolition of PTA levies

29. Lagos State is serious about providing free education and therefore schools and PTAs may not in any circumstances impose levies. This rule is strictly enforced. The Deputy Governor is also the Commissioner of Education and is always ready to investigate complaints from parents. The only people allowed to levy money, according to the outgoing Director of Social Mobilisation, are the Community Development Association. CDAs should be represented on SBMCs. He said it was important for communities to feel they had ownership of the schools.

30. Money is an issue with SBMCs. It was difficult to get the support of those people who matter. People had no detailed knowledge of how SBMCs could work. There was a need to mobilise various kinds of support from development partners for Universal Basic Education.

Inclusivity

How SBMCs were set up in Clusters

31. The first important point was that Lagos is a special case. Because of its size and density it needs to have a different model of organisation and that is why each SBMC serves a Cluster of up to ten schools. This is not in accordance with the SBMC guidelines but these do not have the force of law and Lagos State has adapted the policy to fit in with the reality of the situation found there.

Communication

Communities – communication with SUBEB

32. The outgoing Director spoke of community coalitions of groups such as traders and motor cycle taxi driers, which the COMPASS programme had assisted to build up. His successor then talked about communities that had the intention to start schools. The continued expansion of Lagos meant that some children had a long way to walk to school when there was no school to serve new settlements of population. He said that if SUBEB was approached by a community wanting to start a school, the situation would be assessed by Government. If a need was there, the community was granted permission to start a school and the State then posted teachers to it.

33. The incoming Director noted that PTAs had resisted the idea of SBMCs. PTAs had been active in Lagos for many years. But the problem as he saw it was that PTAs did not represent the community. And community was important.

34. UNICEF had a community focus. The outgoing Director saw former his role as mobilising community interests. He attended a meeting in 2005 where UNICEF laid out their ideas about SBMCs, whose purpose was to contribute to the development of teaching and learning in schools.
Influence

35. The outgoing Director then raised the idea with the Board (of SUBEB), who accepted it. The State Government allocated money so that people could be called to a meeting to launch Lagos SBMCs. Each person attending received N1,000.00 from Lagos State Government.

36. The State had difficulty in monitoring SBMCs because of lack of vehicles. There was a need for a campaign of sensitisation. This would lead to development in schools which in turn would lead to increased registration of children.

37. There was also a discussion of non-registration of children. It was estimated that there were one million children of school age in the State not in school. There was a problem of children being trafficked from other States and from outside the country’s borders for the purpose of labour, particularly domestic labour. Many boys also preferred to enter trades rather than to attend school.

Engineer in charge of Projects

38. In his interview the engineer admitted to knowing little about SBMCs since many projects did not pass through them. He would have preferred a situation where each school had its own SBMC so that they could have ownership of projects. His main points were:

- Need schools and communities to know that they are part of the process, therefore they contribute 20 per cent.
- Ideally need to have a project in each school in an SBMC Cluster, not just one project per Cluster.
- Not every project is initiated by the SBMC though they know the schools’ needs. The idea of a project may come from the Head teacher, who knows more than the SBMC about the needs.
- They give their needs and from their pool of needs SUBEB come up with projects. Projects can be swept away by new projects that come in during the long time it took to approve projects.
- Once a project has been approved, SUBEB write to the school and ask them to form a Project Implementation Committee (PIC). The PIC chair must be a member of the community and the secretary a teacher in the school. The treasurer is the Head teacher.

39. The Engineer said his major role was to sensitise the community to know this was their school, and the work was not all for Government. Lagos State had a policy of no PTA so each school should have its have own SBMC to know how to manage their schools. Communities should come up with ideas, reach consensus and then come to Government.

40. Sometimes a project might be planned: HT – Local Government – SUBEB. In such a case, a project might take place without the SBMC knowing about it. If each school had its own SBMC, the SBMC would have ownership of the project. Clustering was not always efficient.
SBMC & PTA

41. The attempt to interview the PTA Lagos State committee Chairperson was unsuccessful but a member of her committee took her place. He too emphasised lack of money for SBMCs. Any money for schools now had to be routed through SUBEB or the State Government. This meant that individuals or organisations such as churches could no longer give help directly to schools.

SBMC/PTA Conflict

42. The incoming and outgoing Directors of Social Mobilisation had spoken of conflict between PTAs and SBMCs because PTAs felt they had lost power. The PTA official, while agreeing that the PTA was disempowered by lack of money now that levies were abolished, denied the conflict. He said that PTAs were represented on SBMCs, and that they were all working towards the same goal of improving the schools. He himself was an SBMC member.

43. In fact, when he repeated this statement at the end of his interview he made it more emphatic and said that the purpose of both PTA and SBMC was to prevent the collapse of the schools. But SBMCs too had no power because they were not given a subvention. Even where money had been given by Government it had led to confusion because there was another programme funded through SUBEB known as ‘self-help’. He quoted a case where two schools in a Cluster had been given some money which people mistakenly believed had been given to the Cluster, whereas it had been given directly to the schools.

44. In theory the SBMCs gave communities greater involvement in education but they were formed without taking into account the real life situation. The preponderance of academic educationists in the planning process for schools led to a divorce from reality. Such people did not send their children to Government schools and were out of touch with people’s needs at grassroots level, he claimed. He praised the COMPASS programme for paying the expenses of teachers and parents who attended training sessions. In contrast, Government did not pay for SBMC members’ transport costs to meetings or the running costs of meetings.

Action for Change

45. SBMCs were charged with approaching wealthy individuals and companies in the community to solicit contributions. However, big men were just not interested in education these days. In past generations the citizens of Lagos contributed towards the development of schools and built up an excellent system of education. The danger now was that by abolishing PTA levies the Government starved the system of money and formerly good schools would increasingly fall into disrepair.
LGA level findings

Background

46. Alimosho is a relatively new LGA, having been created within the past 15 years. It reaches towards the border with Ogun State. The entire area seen was built up.

LGA Area Offices

47. The research team were told the LGA has six Area Offices in different locations and each controls a Local Community Development Association (LCDA). The Vice Chairman of Egbe-Lagos 2 Area Office was present during research in Lagos 2. Lagos 1 is under a different LCDA.

48. Each community has a CDA, or Community Development Association, controlled by its LCDA, and all the CDAs in the LGA meet monthly. Researchers were told CDAs are only for the people who are ‘landlords’ in the LGA, or ‘sons of the soil’, people whose families have settled in the area for generations.

Formation of SBMC Clusters in Alimosho

49. SBMCs were set up by the LGEA Mobilisation Officer on the instructions of SUBEB. Active community members, including PTA members and teachers, were invited to the LGEA office to form their respective SBMCs. Each SBMC then elected its own officers, including Chairman, Secretary and Treasurer. They were told to have a teacher as the Secretary in each case, so that LGEA officials could easily locate them when needed. In both Lagos 1 and Lagos 2 the assistant Head teachers are SBMC Secretaries.

Schools and Clusters where research took place

(i) Community Primary School Lagos 1, in Cluster 5 SBMC 23 - 27 March 2009
(ii) Community Primary School Lagos 2, in Cluster 2 SBMC 30 March - 4 April 2009.
(iii) Interviews at SUBEB and LGEA level took place 18 – 20 March 2009.

COMPASS Programme

50. The only recent intervention in Alimosho is COMPASS, due to close down in May 2009, which predated the introduction of SBMCs. It worked through PTAs in 25 public primary schools and 11 private Islamiyyah schools, with Head teachers, teachers, pupils and communities. Lagos 2 was included in the COMPASS programme but Lagos 1 was not. COMPASS activities included the training of 12 LGEA staff as trainers and supervisors. The training of trainers was to ensure the sustainability of COMPASS training in schools. This included skills training for teachers, management training for Head teachers and radio programmes for children. COMPASS also worked with parents and communities. Three officers were interviewed: the Education Secretary (ES), the Social Mobilisation Officer in charge of SBMCs, and her assistant Social Mobilisation Officer.
51. The Education Secretary is a very busy man but in order to meet the research team he took time out of a workshop he was attending. The interview was necessarily short as it took place in his moving car.

52. The Mobilisation Officer in charge of SBMCs was part of the research team. She was interviewed during the research planning day since no information had been received from the ESSPIN officer who had made initial contacts and initially there was a need to get some background information. She was later given a formal interview which was mainly repetition but which supplemented the information obtained from the LGEA office.

53. The Assistant Mobilisation Officer was new in the post. The most valuable information gained from him was about training but he also alerted the research team to conflicts within the LGEA concerning which officer should be handling SBMCs. There was confusion in Lagos between Self-Help and SBMC. In fact most money came from Self-Help and the SBMC programme was starved of resources.

Resources

Financial and material

54. A major concern was lack of financial resources for SBMCs. The ES was particularly concerned that there were no vehicles for monitoring SBMCs, but another worry was the fact that there was no money for running SBMCs. Most of the members were retired people who needed money as an incentive to do anything. One officer went so far as to say that the situation was unsatisfactory and people were not interested in working for SBMCs because there were no funds.

55. Most information about SBMC meetings was circulated on mobile telephones through text messages as this was the cheapest way of communicating.

Training

56. The junior mobilisation officer had just returned from a training workshop by UNICEF and UBEC for the South Western States. Out of 37 participants, four had come from Lagos, one being a State level officer and the other three from LGEAs. The training materials from this workshop were academically oriented and not well understood.

Inclusivity

57. The ES said policies were formulated at Federal and State levels without consultation at the grassroots. Having said this, he admitted that things were better now than they were ten years previously at the beginning of the democratic regime. The SBMCs were formed by selecting those people known to the LGEA and the Obas to have an interest in education.

58. Community members’ concerns about schools were mainly channelled through the head teachers, according to the LGEA officials, who thought the person responsible for
ensuring people’s concerns were met were the Obas, not the SBMCs. People’s concerns about levies would have to be directed to the central CDA, since no other organisation than CDA was allowed to levy. CDA was supposed to be represented on the SBMC, however.

59. Children were supposed to be on SBMCs but their attendance was not steady. Because schools rotated in sending children to meetings, it was impossible for LGEA to follow up on the pupils concerned.

60. No SBMC in the LGA had had a meeting in 2009 up to the time of the research in March. This was partly due to a teachers’ strike early in the year. The SBMCs observed during the research were dominated by teachers and were held at an hour of the morning when people with jobs would not be able to attend. Teachers were able to get permission to leave school to attend the meetings.

61. The Guidance notes for SBMCs were photocopied at the LGEA and chairmen of the committees were informed by telephone that they should collect them. However, not all had done so.

**Communication**

62. The LGEA supervised SBMCs quite closely and the mobilisation officers kept records of their minutes. They saw their responsibility as to inform SBMC members of meetings and supervise their activities. There were 58 schools that had to be contacted about SBMC meetings. Information was passed to head teachers by text message. The ES noted that there was no free flow of information between the different departments of the LGA.

**Conflicts**

63. The ES noted two areas of conflict. The PTA had long been in existence and felt threatened by the abolition of levies and the introduction of SBMCs. He himself expressed dissatisfaction that the State Government was able to make decisions on local issues over the heads of LGEA and communities as in the case of an SBMC chairman being called to a meeting in Abuja without the ES or the Oba knowing.

64. The main conflict observed by the mobilisation officer was resentment at spending time and money on SBMC activities. Also, people liked to do something for the school where their own children attended. They previously paid N100 per child per term as PTA levy. SBMCs were for Clusters of schools. The members were expected to go round the community sourcing for money. But the people were reluctant to do this for other people’s children, particularly when it was something that could equally well be done by PTAs. People tended to prefer PTA to SBMC although they were not normally able to distinguish between them.
Influence

65. It was agreed that SBMCs were accountable to the LGEA that inaugurated them. LGEAs were accountable to SUBEB. LGEAs and Obas were familiar with the communities and knew who to appoint to SBMCs. But in spite of community interest and enthusiasm in checking the attendance of teachers and pupils, they could not do much without money.

66. Nevertheless, there had been changes in the schools. SBMCs were encouraging people to use the public schools instead of preferring private schools with less qualified teachers. Moreover, the introduction of kindergarten classes had meant that people no longer had to put their children in day care.

Lagos 1 School and Community

Background

67. Lagos 1 is not densely populated like most of Lagos. It appears to have been farmland until recently, now sold off to people from outside the community to build houses. The area was very quiet in the mornings when the research team were there as if most of the inhabitants had left for work outside the neighbourhood.

68. The community is bisected by a dual carriageway and bounded by a swamp. The Community Primary School, the Baale’s house and the Mosque are at the heart of the neighbourhood. Beyond them the researchers saw locked up shops which presumably would be opened later in the day when commuters came home from work. Near the main road were places where motorists might stop: motor mechanics, fresh fruit stalls, and bars serving beer and soft drinks. There were also motorcycle taxis lined up. Only a few people were encountered at the beginning of the week of research. Young men were seen apparently idle and middle aged men were seen drinking mid morning. The Awori in this community appeared to be selling off their land and living on the proceeds.

69. The school has a borehole that is not functioning and older girls collect water from a neighbouring borehole for the children to drink.

School and community

70. The school was built at the request of the community. In 1999 they donated land and in 2001 the school was completed by Government. The teachers are not community members and gave little information about Lagos 1 except that the people were poor and the children were not well-nourished. The Head teacher described the parents as ‘peasants and housewives’.

CDA

71. Interaction between researchers, Baale, members of the CDA and parents of the children in the school brought out information about how artisans in the community
Other community organisations

72. An NGO concerned with improved nutrition and health of children is run by an Lagos 1 member of the SBMC who has tried to provide nutritious snacks for the school children, but was prevented by Government regulations regarding food.

73. The churches in the community are not active in the school, though the treasurer of the SBMC is a pastor and as an individual takes an active part in SBMC work.

74. The mosque in Lagos 1 runs Islamic classes and there is an Islamiyyah school within the community, but they are not part of the SBMC.

Lagos 1 Community Primary School

75. The school is double streamed but has only six classrooms and a partitioned section of the administrative block used as a nursery class. The classrooms are overcrowded with 70 – 100 children present in one room, with either one or two teachers teaching them. Teaching was taking place. Registers were properly filled in. The teachers are well qualified and experienced and the school is well organised.

76. The children are clean, punctual, eager to learn and actually gaining basic literacy skills. The six children interviewed were such good readers that the research team tested their writing skills as well. They jointly wrote a story which has since been illustrated and printed commercially.

Cluster 5 SBMC

77. Lagos 1 is in Cluster 5 SBMC, which meets in a school about 15 minutes’ drive away, nearer into Lagos. Only the Assistant Head teacher attends SBMC meetings, and he is the secretary. The PTA was active in the past and has contributed to repairs and renovations in the school. The teachers and community are concerned that it is no longer operational.

78. Community members had never heard of the SBMC. Teachers in Lagos 1 School had heard about it but knew nothing about it. Children and youth are not on the SBMC. The SBMC chairman said: ‘Absence of youth may be because they haven’t received information. There is a youth forum [within the area served by the SBMC]. At meetings we have talked about the youth.’ The Youth Forum is an organisation that could possibly be mobilised for community development. The members, judging by the two met by the researchers representing their aged father at the Cluster 5 SBMC meeting, may not be particularly young, but appear to constitute unmarried and probably unemployed but fairly well educated men.

79. Those interviewed during the research were:
(i) SBMC Cluster 5 chairman, a secondary school teacher from within the Cluster.
(ii) The SBMC secretary is the assistant head teacher of Lagos 1 School.
(iii) Head teacher, Lagos 1 Community Primary School, an experienced teacher, well qualified, transferred to Lagos 1 as head teacher about a year ago.
(iv) Female Teacher, Lagos 1 Community Primary School, highly experienced and qualified, not on the SBMC. She has been with the school about ten years.
(v) Baale of Lagos 1, a the community leader. He lives in the centre of the community and meetings take place on his veranda. He is a welder by trade and the welders association is very active in the CDA.
(vi) A Lagos State University lecturer who has set up an NGO concerned with nutrition and early childhood. She is a community member, active in the school, and a member of the Cluster 5 SBMC to which Lagos 1 belongs.
(vii) SBMC Cluster 5 members in a Focus Group Discussion.
(viii) Three boys and three girls, from classes 5 and 6.
(ix) Two separate groups of mothers, 15 in the first and 7 in the second, in a Focus Group Discussion. The second group did a Venn diagram.
(x) A group of fathers who met in the Baale’s compound.
(xi) Two members of the Lagos 1 Community Development Association (CDA) who described the how they worked with CLEDEP in 2005 to fence the school.

Resources

Financial & other material resources

80. The Cluster 5 SBMC Chairman complained that most of the things they had wanted to do were handicapped by lack of money. The committee would work better if members were paid their expenses: ‘We are using personal money to convey people to meetings etc.’ Things they had hoped to do included:

- ‘We wanted to do something about improving teachers’ but need money to motivate teachers
- They had hoped to take children who played truant to the Oba for discipline but there was no money to take them.

81. The female teacher in reply to ‘How do you think the SBMC could be improved?’ said ‘Finance them!’ She added that they could not do repairs around the school because they no longer had a PTA to help them. She was also concerned about the poverty in the community, particularly malnutrition in children: ‘Some children are not well fed and can’t learn easily as a result.’

82. However, the Community Leader, the Baale of Lagos 1 said: ‘Members of the local community do contribute to whatever the school needs when the PTA was still in existence but now even the Head teacher is so afraid to collect money from anybody. But sometimes we donate exercise books to the pupils.’

83. The head teacher said she gets monthly running costs for the school from Local Government, but they are insufficient.
Skills and capacity

84. The community contains skilled artisans. The Community Leader said local organisations that support the school were ‘Welders Association, Block Makers Association, CDA.’

85. The children have adequate writing skills to copy letters the school sends home to inform parents of anything that the school needs to communicate.

86. The teachers are teaching regularly and are well qualified. The children do learn. However, the female teacher said: ‘If I know I’m doing my best there’s nothing more to do.’ This seems to show rather a defeatist attitude among teachers.

Training and support

87. Cluster 5 SBMC Chairman said he attended seminars:
   - two main ones and others on administrative aspects at State Govt. HQ
   - a one week programme on school based management structure organised by UNICEF and UNDP

There was a seminar on whole school development, how to source funds and mobilise the community, the child, how children should be cared for, included and empowered.
However, the training was only for chair and secretary of the SBMC, on whole school management development.

Networks

88. Lagos 1 NGO Coordinator for Center for Youth and Human Resources Development works with the school on nutrition and nursery education. Otherwise the main support seems to be from the CDA.

Motivation and reward

89. SBMC members incur expenses in the course of their work and get no financial reward; motivation seems to be only in terms of improved social status. The SBMC chairman said: ‘I see that the people I meet are ones I have never thought to see such as Kabiyesi [the Oba].’

Inclusivity

Membership

90. Observation of the Cluster 5 SBMC meeting showed that members are mostly head teachers and teachers including junior secondary teachers, a pastor, and PTA representatives. Community heads were not on the committee.

91. Lagos 1 Head teacher said she was a member of SBMC but didn’t actually go – her assistant was the secretary of SBMC Cluster 5 whose chairman said SBMC members are civil servants, principals, head teachers and PFA chairmen. When probed: ‘What of market women, the disabled etc?’ he said ‘We’re hoping to get to that later.’
Processes of formation

92. The Cluster 5 Chairman said the SBMC was inaugurated December 2008. He was nominated as a member, then elected Chair. ‘I was called to a meeting at the LGEA and the Community Mobilisation officer’s team first introduced us to the idea.’ He was told his chairmanship should count as from 2009. ‘There is no specification in the Guidelines as to how long chairman should stay.’

Role of women

93. There are many women members of the SBMC. But it was observed that key officers are men.

Role of the poor

94. The Lagos 1 Head teacher mentioned a Cluster member who supports the school financially. This is something a poor person could not do, and it is obviously expected of SBMC members. The SBMC FGD agreed: a woman without a husband but with children would not have enough money to be a member of the SBMC. Observation of SBMC Cluster 5 showed no poor people. Several members arrived driving cars.

Role of children

95. The Lagos 1 Head teacher had not until recently realised that children were supposed to be on the SBMC. She said: ‘Last meeting they said children should be among [SBMC].’

Note: There do not appear to have been children present at any meetings. The members of the SBMC are aware that the Guidelines require their presence but it would be difficult to organise this when SBMCs consist of Clusters of schools.

96. The interview with Lagos 1 children showed:

- They don’t know about SBMC,
- don’t know chairman’s name
- No children are members of SBMC.

Communication

Profile and presence of SBMC

97. Chairman SBMC Cluster 5 said there is awareness as a result of SBMC activities among students, market women and trades unions.

98. This does not tally with the fact that the Lagos 1 female teacher had very little knowledge of what SBMC was doing andd Lagos 1 mothers said: ‘We are not aware of any group called SBMC yet.’ Lagos 1 children and community had never heard of SBMC. However, the SBMC minutes indicate discussion actually takes place unlike in Cluster 2.

Communication of SBMC decisions to the wider community

99. The Chairman, Cluster 5 SBMC, during their FGD said they communicate their decisions to other institutions by sending circulars to artisan groups, market women, builders, okada riders, carpenters, and drivers. They have also met with religious bodies. At
Lagos 1 the Imam went round disseminating information. They even used town criers. However, the Mothers FGD said the SBMC did not communicate its decisions to them.

100. There is a youth forum within the area served by the Cluster; but youth were not involved in the SBMC whose members said in their FGD that the ‘absence of youth may be because they haven’t received information. At meetings we have talked about the youth.’

**Communication between school and SBMC**

101. Lagos 1 head teacher first heard of the SBMC when a letter arrived introducing the Cluster and saying the school should be part of it. She is not involved in its planning and rarely attends meetings however. When asked whether there was a School Development Plan she said ‘I think so – they are always going round the schools. During their meetings we just write what we want.’ The female teacher knew less: ‘I heard [SBMC] are helping schools.’

102. Chairman Cluster 5 SBMC apparently did not see SBMC as a grassroots organisation – ‘problem is that people are not well educated’.

**Communication between LGEA and SBMC**

103. Cluster 5 chairman said the SBMC was required by the LGEA to open a bank account. Individuals made contributions. He was also told by LGEA how long he would hold office. He thought the SBMC Guidelines he had been given might not be the actual document. The head teacher believes he has the Guidelines and makes use of them. She has seen the guidance notes, though she had no copy at the time of her interview.

**Tensions and conflicts**

104. Two young men turned up at the SBMC Cluster 5 meeting representing their aged father who is a member by virtue of being a PTA chairman. When the issue of membership came up in the FGD they expressed frustration at youth not being involved. They said there was a Youth Forum to which they belonged and that the Youth Forum ought to be represented on SBMC. They were invited to the feedback session in Lagos 1 on 27 March and when they came they were given leaflets about ESSPIN.

105. Lagos 1 Head teacher said there were problems making repairs to the school since PTA could no longer help them, but sometimes things could be arranged so that parents could give help: ‘No more PTA. Abolished immediately I came.’

**Influence**

**Accountability**

106. The Lagos 1 female teacher on responsibility for children who cannot read said:

- Some children are not well fed and can’t learn easily as a result.
- ‘If I know I’m doing my best there’s nothing more to do.’
- ‘Automatic promotion and transition is not helping.’
• ‘In our day we’d work hard to make sure your mates don’t leave you behind. Now we’re not allowed to give them a zero or a one – we must not fail pupils.’
• ‘So they get to secondary school unable to even write their names. And they don’t respect their teachers, especially in secondary school.’

107. Lagos 1 Head teacher said responsibility for repairs lies with Government. ‘But they will tell you they will do it and they will not do it. For example, my office: I don’t like how it is, before I would have called PTA to help.’

108. SBMC Cluster 5 Chairman during SBMC FGD said that ‘SBMC should be courtesied for anything about budget in the school,’ to help them prioritise the budget. Accountability goes: SBMC – School Head – LGEA – SUBEB.

109. Lagos 1 Mothers in their FGD said they did not know which institutions were more or less powerful and they did not know who the school and the LGEA were accountable to.

**Within SBMC, who makes the decisions**

110. Reading the minutes books from the Lagos 1 SBMC there is genuine discussion but observing the SBMC meeting on 25 March 2009 the chairman had an agenda written down and controlled the meeting tightly.

**SBMC power and influence in relation to school and other local institutions (horizontal)**

111. The SBMC does not appear to have any influence in relation to the school and community in Lagos 1. The Baale didn’t know whether school had an SBMC. The head teacher said she was the one responsible for the school budget, not any outside committee. The loss of PTA help is felt sharply: ‘PTA is so direct to the school, compared with SBMC. Some parents – when PTA was functioning - would come and see to anything needing doing in the school. But now there are money constraints’.

**SBMC Power and influence in relation to LGA (vertical)**

112. Cluster 5 SBMC chair says he must take instructions from higher authorities and ‘melt it down to the point where its effect is appreciated.’

**Possibilities for promoting collective action for change**

113. The Cluster 5 SBMC Chairman said: ‘I am an agent of change.’ The emphasis seemed to be on ‘I’ and the chances of collective action seem limited. He said ‘We bring people together; sometimes they become tired. But we are continuing in our own way. We share strategies to meet Unions, CDAs etc. We are selling the idea of change. The SBMC executive met with CDA chairman. But later there will be a large meeting for the wider group when we’ve strategised.
‘We have gone round the schools (7) late last year. We asked them to do things: Prioritise problems in areas of
(a) structures
(b) late-coming of teachers and pupils
(c) counselling children.
‘We have gone round to the Kabiyesi’s and they are very happy but to get them to act, I don’t know. We are trying to get on with fund raising.’

**Improving education**

*How the organisations observed contribute towards improved education*

**ACCESS**

114. In Lagos 1 absenteeism is not bad though some children travel out of the community for Muslim festivals and miss a week or two of school.

115. The SBMC Cluster 5 chairman said that one of the functions of his committee was to trace children truanting from school and report them to the chief. How far Lagos 1 would be involved in this exercise is dubious since they are away from the main area of settlement where the SBMC meets.

**EQUITY**

116. Lagos 1 boys and girls attend school in fairly equal numbers but a case was encountered of a girl being kept away from school during exam time because she was needed for help in the house. She was one of those selected for interview and was able to read and write well. Children from Ghanaian and Togolese families attend the school and it was reported that their parents used to attend PTA meetings when they were held. None of them are on the SBMC, which consists mainly of teachers and some retired artisans.

**QUALITY**

117. Lagos 1 community members do not consider themselves competent to judge the quality of teachers’ work. The fact that they send children to school punctually and provide them with writing materials is a major factor contributing to the school’s success.

**What works in this context and why**

118. Cluster 5 SBMC is too far removed from Lagos 1 community physically but within the community there is enough competence to organise projects. There are few well educated people but the artisans have basic literacy and have proved their ability to organise a project when they erected a wall around the school in 2005 – 2006 through CLEDEP.

119. Lagos 1 community send their children to school looking neat and clean. There is an issue of poor nutrition and some children are not living with their own parents, but there is enough willingness to contribute to children’s education in this community. Most of the children seen in class had pencils and exercise books. This is not by any means universal in Nigeria and it indicates some commitment on the part of the parents towards their children’s education.
Lagos 2 School and Community

Background

120. Lagos 2 is a long established community with a high ranking Oba. The area covered by the community is small with a large number of people squeezed into dwellings that are either old and crumbling, with plaster falling off traditional mud brick walls, or else fairly new simple houses with zinc roofs. The road into it extends a little way past the Oba’s palace, and then it is necessary to walk over an unpaved path criss-crossed by gutters. Houses are so close together that only one person at a time can pass between them. Immediately next to the community is the main road out of Lagos heading towards Lagos 1. Many of the people are Muslims but there are also churches. At the heart of the community is a traditional shrine.

121. The community has a borehole and water tank donated by the Church of the Latter Day Saints. A community member is in charge of this and about once a month goes round the houses and shops collecting levies for maintenance of the borehole and tank. The tank is elevated and anyone who wants to collect water carries a large bowl or bucket on their head. There is a back entrance to the Lagos 2 Community School that leads directly into the heart of the community, and senior girls from the school collect water from this tank in the mornings and again at break time so that the children can have drinking and washing water.

122. During the transect conducted between 7.30 am and 8.30 am on a working day, many middle aged men were seen idle in the community, some of them drinking or gambling. Women were seen with wrappers tied round loosely, looking as if they were on their way to bath. The LGEA researcher said these people were the Awori who lived off rents.

123. There were some shops open, including a gambling house. One small building advertised a traditional birth attendant whose services are much in demand as women prefer not to go to hospital to have their babies. By 8.30 some food was ready at a cook-shop near the back of the school.

Lagos 2 Community Primary School

(i) The school shares a large, walled compound with two other buildings: Lagos 2 LGEA Primary School and an abandoned block of six classrooms, unroofed - a Federal Government project so nothing could be done with it.

(ii) There is a non-functional borehole and water tank, put in by UNICEF.

(iii) There are no toilets. The neighbouring school has toilets but there is no water.

School population

(i) There are 450 boys and 482 girls in the school.

(ii) There are four streams of primary classes. There is also a nursery.

(iii) There are two classes in each of the 13 primary classrooms except in class 4 where one room contains combined classes but two rooms have one class each.
(iv) Most children are squeezed into seats but some of class 1 were seen sitting on the floor. Some furniture was supplied by the LCDA.
(v) Buildings are well maintained in spite of the overcrowding.

**Teaching**

(i) The school is well run by a highly qualified Head teacher. She is not a community member and does not go to SBMC meetings.
(ii) Teachers are qualified and were teaching well. All the blackboards showed the teachers’ neat and legible handwriting.
(iii) Children had textbooks and were using them in class. They were able to read them.
(iv) Most teaching aids were locked up in the office for fear of ‘hoodlums’.

**Community**

124. There were two major complaints from the community:

(i) Mothers complained that the school building was used for parties at weekends and classrooms then used as toilets
(ii) SBMC and mothers complained that community youth play football on the school compound, breaking windows and roofs.

**Findings summarised**

125. **Cluster 2 SBMC:** Lagos 2 has 2 primary schools and one junior secondary school, which have been placed in SBMC Cluster 2 along with the schools of two other kingdoms, Isheri and Egbeda. The Oba of Lagos 2 is active and very interested in education. He maintains a tight control of what happens on the SBMC.

126. **CDA:** The Lagos 2 CDA has had an Education Sub Committee for more than ten years. The SBMC seems to have been assimilated to this and it would be interesting to find out how far the other two Obas are involved in this SBMC. Community action could probably be effective if the SBMC were restricted to Lagos 2 kingdom.

127. Those interviewed during the research were:

(i) SBMC Cluster 2 chairperson, a retired mason and a pastor, also secretary of another SBMC.
(ii) Head teacher, Lagos 2 Community Primary School, an extremely competent and experienced teacher, well qualified.
(iii) Female Teacher, Lagos 2 Community Primary School, experienced and qualified, not on the SBMC.
(iv) Oba of Lagos 2, a high ranking chief with a palace he throws open to the community for meetings, settling disputes etc. He is quoted at State and LGEA level as well as in the schools for his personal donation of N150,000 to provide community counterpart funding for a school building.
(v) Market women’s leader, who had never heard of SBMCs until the day of her interview.
(vi) SBMC Cluster 2 members in a Focus Group Discussion.
(vii) Three boys and three girls, all from class 6.
(viii) Group of about 20 mothers who did social and resource mapping during their FGD in the school.
(ix) A group of 4 fathers who did a Venn diagram during their FGD.
(x) People met in Lagos 2 community, in particular a woman who had previously moved her child to a private school.

Resources

Financial and material resources

128. Cluster 2 SBMC: the Chairman said: ‘Our greatest challenge is money’ and that he had to work without being paid. Nevertheless he claimed the SBMC had undertaken some projects. It was not always clear how far the SBMC had implemented these projects and how far they were done directly by Government. In the Lagos 2 Community Primary School the Chairman said that they had renovated six classrooms in the school but it appeared that actually this was done by the LCDA. He claimed that SBMC had fixed a gate in the school. He admitted that the school generator was donated by Local Government.

129. He made the point that in spite of the fact that they had no money the SBMC members had held meetings, providing for transportation and stationery at their personal expense.

130. In the Cluster 2 SBMC FGD people spoke of the most effective way to get help for schools in cash or kind in emergencies being to contact the Oba, and mentioned N150,000 the Oba once gave for a project. The Oba himself, when interviewed separately, said that the responsibility lay with SBMC or PTA if Government didn’t do it.

131. In terms of making provision for the school, the Lagos 2 female teacher said members of the local community did not donate money but provided only furniture. The Egbe-Lagos 2 Local Government Area Office supplied the children with five exercise books each. She said, ‘The local community are trying. They supply us with furniture, but no furniture for teachers.’

132. This is a teacher who appeared to be unaware of the existence of the SBMC and was only concerned with the school where she was teaching and the provision of help that had formerly come from the PTA. She spoke of the COMPASS programme, saying they supplied desks and benches for children.

Skills and capacity

133. Lagos 2 has an active CDA with an Education Committee. The Oba is intelligent, active, seen daily settling disputes. The capacity of the community is increased even further by the fact that the HOD Education in the LGA and also the Vice Chairman of the Local Government Egbe-Lagos 2 office take an interest in the community.
Training and support

134. The Cluster 2 SBMC chairman had just returned from SBMC training in Abuja at the time of the research. There is no training at community level however. The Lagos 2 female teacher interviewed said that in order to improve the SBMC there should be training for community people, teachers, and children on awareness. Help in training and capacity came from the COMPASS programme, including training for parents. When COMPASS trained teachers, they came regularly to inspect.

Networks

135. The Lagos 2 head teacher said that the CDA, Lagos 2 Local Development Area, had donated 100 desks and benches and renovated block of 3 classrooms in her school. The CDAs are supposed to be represented on SBMCs, so there is a cross-cutting of membership.

136. The Oba of Lagos 2 said members of the local community support the school by visiting regularly. The Lagos 2 Education Committee meets every first Wednesday of the month. Members are selected from CDA. He also said the CDA and Local Government support the school.

137. In Lagos 2 it is quite difficult to sort out where the SBMC ends and the Education Committee begins. But the Cluster 2 SBMC is for two other kingdoms in addition to Lagos 2.

138. The Lagos 2 school profile showed that:
   - COMPASS had supported the school.
   - A Classroom block and generator had been received from Government.
   - A Borehole had been donated from UNICEF (not functioning).

139. During the SBMC Cluster 2 FGD in the Oba’s Palace they did social and resource mapping showing:
   - Health Centre for treatment of school children
   - Police Station which secures the school and the children
   - The palace where people refer issues too difficult to handle to the Oba
   - The Market. Mothers work there. People live around that neighbourhood. Chief of the market settles disputes in the market.

Motivation and reward

140. Informal discussion at LGEA indicated that some teachers prefer posting far from home so that people won’t know they’re teachers. There had been a teachers’ strike in Lagos shortly before the research exercise. Teachers were expressing their dissatisfaction to the team because of the very large classes they had to deal with and the lack of facilities in schools.
Inclusivity

Membership

141. Cluster 2 SBMC chairman said that the members of the committee were head teachers, trade women, a nurse, a tailor, male and female students, a community man, Female and Male market leaders, a technician, and the present Oba. He would willingly serve again in spite of the need to pay his own expenses. He said that within the area covered by Cluster 2 there are 3 Obas: of Egbeda, Lagos 2 and Isheri. The Oba of Lagos 2 is a member of the Cluster 2 SBMC. The Oba of Isheri has a representative who is a woman. The Oba of Egbeda also has a representative.

142. The head teacher Lagos 2 Community Primary School said the SBMC could be improved with wider membership not just selected people. The Oba of Lagos 2 said it should include business men and NGOs.

Processes of formation

143. The SBMC was set up by selection rather than election. The chairman said he was a PTA chairman and he was called as a PTA executive member and told there was to be a meeting in the SUBEB office around June 2008. That’s when he first knew of SBMCs. He became chair was when 3 Obas with the members of the people sat together and decided that they should spread the offices around all the schools that formed the Cluster. He was nominated as former PTA chair. The assistant is from another school etc. Each group nominated one person to come from them as an officer so every community has a representative.

144. Cluster 2 SBMC also has a security sub-committee; there are 8 of them including women, monitoring footballers who use the school field.

145. The Oba of Lagos 2 said: ‘Pastor Osoba [Cluster 2 Chair] helped us to mobilise. We nominated people from each school and community including female and male market leaders.’ How he knew about SBMC was that the present chairman told him. There was no letter and no information on radio or TV.

146. Lagos 2 Community Primary School head teacher said there were no student members from her school, only from the neighbouring school. Her school provided the SBMC secretary. In fact it appears that no primary pupils have ever attended a meeting.

Role of women

147. There are women members of the SBMC and according to the Chairman ‘they are the ones who even talk more at meetings.’

Role of the poor

148. The Chair of SBMC Cluster 2 said: ‘We spend money without being paid.’ The implication is that poor people cannot be members. He said the SBMC is a cross section of the community but added: ‘If only we have finance.’
149. Poverty is an issue in Lagos 2. The SBMC Chair said parents had refused to collect books given out by government. ‘Parents were not coming because government said that any book spoiled or lost would be replaced by parents’ - poor people are afraid of financial commitment. This was confirmed by a mother met during the research exercise’s Lagos 2 transect. The chairman said many children don’t have writing materials but SBMC executives take it on themselves to talk to parents one on one and this has really helped.

Role of children
150. The Oba of Lagos 2 said the role of student members of the SBMC is to arrange the school and supervise cleaning. ‘SBMC doesn’t concern students too much. SBMC only gives commands to students.’ According to the SBMC minutes, one JSS student attended once.

Communication
Profile and presence of SBMC
151. There was a lot of ignorance about the SBMC among those who were not members. The Oba of Lagos 2 complained that the issue of SBMC was not publicised: ‘No radio, no TV. There is a need for sensitisation.’

152. The female teacher interviewed in Lagos 2 was asked if she knew anything about the SBMC and she answered, ‘I think it is the people in the community who is representing SBMC and they have done a lot by providing exercise books.’

153. The Lagos 2 women’s market leader was asked ‘Is there an SBMC at your school?’ and answered ‘Yes, just of recent,’ but in fact apparently had not known until the interviewer told her. When asked how she heard about SBMC she said ‘Somebody told me that some people are around to help some children who are hawking.’

154. Lagos 2 children’s interview, conducted as a game, showed that children had never heard of the SBMC and that none of them attended meetings. However, they did understand that in a committee people bring together ideas and make decisions.

155. In the FGD with Lagos 2 mothers it was apparent that they did not know what was meant by SBMC. They then said that there were no conflicts.

Communication of SBMC decisions to the wider community
156. Cluster 2 SBMC records show Date of last meeting. 27 February 2009 Agenda: Opening of bank account. World Bank Self Help Project of UBE 450,000 to be Olorunfunmi Junior Grammar School in Cluster 2. Apparently there were no decisions, only instructions from the chair.

157. The Lagos 2 female teacher said she was never informed about SBMC. She doesn’t know the role of women or children members of the SBMC or how the PTA and SBMC work together or whether there are any conflicts.
**Communication between school and SBMC**

158. During the SBMC FGD it was stated that the head teacher informs the committee of any money in the budget and they advise on how to spend it. The chairman said his main role was to coordinate the activities of the group and act as intermediary between the school and the community.

159. The head teacher, Lagos 2 Community Primary School said she received no letter about the formation of SBMCs but heard about it on radio. Then the chairman phoned to say it had started. She didn’t know how they elected the chairman. The main role of the SBMC according to the chairman and the Oba, she said, was doing the same as the PTA and more.

160. According to the Oba of Lagos 2 the main role of the PTA is to contribute money and PFA [Parent Forum Association, the renamed PTA without teachers] the same. The only difference is that they are not allowed to meet at the school so meet in the palace. He said it was only parents who paid levies anyway, implying that teachers were not missed.

161. The Lagos 2 female class teacher interviewed was not aware of an SBMC in her school.

**Communication between LGEA and SBMC**

162. In the FGD with SBMC Cluster 2 the members perceived the line of communication as SUBEB – LGEA – schools – chairman [ie top down through HT].

163. In the Lagos 2 mothers’ FGD they said the responsibility to make decisions about the school budget lay with head teacher and the Chairman of the LGA. They did not mention the SBMC. The Oba of Lagos 2 said responsibility for making decisions about the school budget lies with State and Federal Ministries of Education.

**Tensions and conflicts**

164. Lagos 2 head teacher said there is no PTA any more, only PFA which does not meet except at class level, concerning children’s work at an open day. There is no problem with them. Some former PTA members are now on the SBMC. Any repairs, such as roof repair, should be done through LGEA to SUBEB, ‘Since Government don’t want PTA to raise money we now put our report every three months. Previously PTA would have done it but now they dare not.’

165. The Lagos 2 female teacher said the main role of PTA is to contribute to the progress of the school but now it has been abolished.

166. Lagos 2 fathers said conflict is settled by the Oba, especially where there is fighting between women. They did not interpret the question about conflict as concerning conflict between institutions, only as personal conflicts.
Influence

Accountability

167. The SBMC Cluster 2 chairman considered the main role of SBMC to be to get the community to participate in the affairs of the school, to bring about harmony between school and community.

168. The Oba of Lagos 2 said PTA is all community representatives working hand in hand. SBMC gives directives to the PTA.

169. Cluster 2 SBMC in their FGD said the head teacher and teachers are accountable to school and LGEA; SBMC is accountable to LGEA.

170. Lagos 2 mothers said SBMC is accountable to members of school.

Within SBMC, who makes the decisions

171. SBMC Chairman Cluster 2 (Pastor Osoba) appears to make all decisions. Almost every paragraph in the minutes book starts ‘Pastor Osoba said...’ It is possible he is also speaking on behalf of the Oba, who is not normally present.

SBMC power and influence in relation to school and other local institutions (horizontal)

172. The Chairman of SBMC Cluster 2 said the changes seen in the school or community as a result of the SBMCs activities are

• Interaction between teachers and parents.
• Some renovations have been made.

When asked about the existence of School Development Plan he said, ‘It’s with the HM - it’s a list. Every school has a list. No plan but we have a list of all the problems.’

SBMC power and influence in relation to LGA (vertical)

173. In the SBMC Cluster 2 FGD the members made it clear they took instructions from and reported to LGEA. The Lagos 2 Female Teacher said responsibility for a problem with the roof is with LGEA.

Possibilities for promoting collective action for change

174. There is no record of action planning in the Cluster 2 SBMC Minute Book. The discussion is on ceremonial visits and administrative matters. The Chairman said the advantages of being SBMC chair were ‘I am a part of progress. Of change.’

Improving education

How the organisations observed contribute towards improved education

ACCESS

• SBMC is combating apathy in parents who are not interested in education, and encouraging them to take up government offer of free textbooks.
• SBMC is encouraging less apathetic parents to send their children to government schools.
• Children in school uniform were seen in the community after school starting time. SBMC members claim that they check on children who are absent from school.

EQUITY

• Individual SBMC members pay school fees for orphans.
• The Head teacher and 21 of the 22 class teachers in the Lagos 2 Community Primary School are female, providing role models and potential counsellors for girls.

QUALITY

175. The quality of teaching in Lagos 2 Community Primary School is good but there are too many children in class for a good quality of learning to obtain. There are enough teachers for more classes and in the past the community has provided extra classrooms. COMPASS has provided a potentially sustainable model of training and supervision, with 12 LGEA level trainers ready for work if they can be mobilised.

What works in this context and why

176. The Lagos 2 Kingdom is dominated by a wealthy and powerful Oba who is intelligent, hard working, committed to his community and well-liked. He donated counterpart funding for a project to the value of N150,000 and informants spoke about this at state, LGEA, school and community level.

177. This model can be seen as an instance of 'big-man-ism' but his top-down way may be the most effective way of operating in a slum community where people are complacent and uninterested in their children’s education.

178. The SBMC Cluster 2 is certainly meeting regularly even though it is not constituted according to the Guidelines for SBMCs. Lagos 2 has a community secondary school as well as a Community Primary School and both are on land donated by the community.

179. However, about a quarter of the children are not indigenous to this community. It is not known how far their families participate in the community life.

Discussion & analysis

180. This section is based on a series of statements developed by the research team (in bold). The response to the statements reflects the extent to which Lagos cases support or contradict the statements, in order to avoid the pitfall of generalising from the case studies.

PTAs

181. The abolition of the PTA levy has led to a decline in activity of PTAs, a shortage of funding at school level and pressure on SBMC members to dig into their own pockets. In Lagos this statement is particularly true. Head teachers and other teachers are having their names publicised on the radio if a parent reports them for asking for money for
school development. This means they are terrified of taking even legitimate donations for fear of disgrace. The schools have depended on help from PTA to do minor repairs, supply deficiencies in equipment and serve as a source of help in emergencies.

182. SBMCs have no funds and members are using their own money for transport to meetings, photocopying minutes and other day to day needs. They are also, as individuals, providing charitable help to needy children.

183. In the Cluster 5 meeting’s focus group discussion on 25 March 2009 the members explicitly stated that an unmarried mother could not be a member of the SBMC, simply because she would not have enough money. The majority of members there are teachers and retired artisans – people who are not wealthy, but are not badly off.

**SBMC Policy**

184. Inadequately conceptualised and articulated SBMC policy has resulted in lack of clarity in roles, relationships, communication and management among stakeholders (PTAs, government structures, development partners and civil society groups). The Cluster 2 SBMC showed no knowledge of the policy guidelines. When asked about the role of children, the Oba of Lagos 2 said ‘SBMC doesn’t concern students too much. SBMC only gives commands to students.’ Their role, he said, was to arrange the school and supervise cleaning.

185. The existence of many versions of policy guidelines and absence in some cases has contributed to variations in SBMC composition, decision making process as well as the selection process of its membership.

Not a single copy of the SBMC Guidelines was seen during the 3 weeks’ research in Lagos. The chairman of the Cluster 5 SBMC was shown those in the researchers’ notebooks and said that what he had seen when he went for UNICEF training was something like this but not exactly the same.

186. Gender guidelines: The Cluster 5 SBMC meeting had more women than men but this was because teachers and head teachers were attending – some of whom are not always there. The teaching profession in Lagos is 80 per cent female. The officers of the SBMC were mostly men. The HT said she didn’t attend. SBMC Cluster 2 list includes 22 names, 9 women, 12 men (including the Oba who does not attend but is nominally there) and one JSS student who turned up once.

187. Children were not seen as suitable for SBMC membership

188. Composition of SBMCs in Clusters in some cases with unclear motives and benefits as this limits awareness of SBMCs in Cluster schools.

In rather remote Lagos 1 the community did not know of the existence of SBMC, whose activities took place some distance from them.
189. In Lagos 2 the SBMC did not coincide with the community boundaries. The chief of the market women did not know of its existence, in spite of the fact that the Chairman said she was an SBMC member. The teachers were not interested in it because they were people from outside the community and area. The people involved in it were the Education Committee members of the community’s CDA as well as teachers and members from other communities.

190. **Expected roles of SBMC as articulated in the policy guidelines require a minimum capacity, hence an implication for current SBMC composition.**

The two SBMCs seen in Lagos were dominated by teachers. All records were in English. There was translation of discussions into Yoruba for the benefit of those less proficient in the language but all members were able to get by in English and all could write their names for attendance purposes.

191. Cluster 5 SBMC chairman saw lack of education of the population as one of the problems of the SBMC, saying that most people are not well educated, people are not literate (by which he probably means they don’t speak English much) and he himself is from a different State and doesn’t speak much Yoruba.

**SBMC Implementation**

192. **SBMC activities include checking truancy among pupils and teachers and encouraging pupils’ learning via incentives, biscuits, writing materials.**

Checking truancy among pupils was one of the things the Lagos SBMCs claimed to do. Cluster 5 chairman said they also checked late-coming. In Lagos 2, in Cluster 2, the research team perceived late-coming as a problem. They did not give incentives to children. The number of schools in each SBMC and the number of children in each would make this impossible in Lagos unless SBMC members were hugely wealthy and the very many wealthy people in Lagos are not interested in education. As Alhaji Olatunji of the PTA committee said, in answer to a question about the role of the SBMC:

193. **SBMCs have the power to effect substantial change.**

This has not been seen in Lagos where SBMC doesn’t represent community and is tightly controlled by government.

194. **The formation of the SBMC reduces the amount of representation by community members, most especially for residents who are ‘foreigners’. It tends to favour the elite. SBMC members are usually selected according to variable criteria that tend to favour elite or prominent individuals. SBMC members hope to gain power and status from their positions.**

195. In Lagos there were no very big men seen on SBMCs, but mainly teachers and members of the local community elite only. SBMCs were set up following LGEA directive and HTs selected people they thought would do the work required. Both SBMC chairmen, one a
secondary school teacher and one a Pastor, found that their position gave them access to people of a slightly higher social status than their own.

196. **SBMCs have no financial resources. Lack of funding and financial support for SBMC.**
Noted in interviews at all levels. Yet the incoming Director of Social Mobilisation said ‘Free education for all at all levels is the policy. We don’t encourage the collection of levies. We leave the community to collect on their own. They know how to manage their crises.’ (1.1)

**Governance**

197. **Most community members are unaware about what SBMC is and its activities.** State Level PTA: ‘They are supposed to have meetings but what will they discuss? There is no funding from government to do anything.’ SBMCs are seen as an instrument of the State, accountable to Government rather than the community. 1a.4.5 Director of Mobilisation at SUBEB said: ‘There is resistance [to SBMCs] by PTA who believe they are the ones to oversee activities of schools. But they cannot represent the community.’ Communities and teachers said SBMC was responsible to LGEA

198. **There is very poor flow of information from communities and schools upwards.**
This is not true in Lagos where SBMC feels responsible to the LGEA and gives reports. Government has tight control of the schools in Alimosho and those seen are relatively good. It is not clear how far the SBMC understands the communities’ needs, and information from them could be misleading.

199. **LGEA and State Government are keen to influence SBMCs.**
State level PTA: “Even some churches wanted to help a school – they themselves will go to SUBEB or Alausa [State MOE] to get permission. They can’t go straight to a school to help because SBMC is not recognised; it’s a Government baby!” 1c.2.4

200. **Participation in SBMCs is limited.**
In Lagos there is little incentive to be an SBMC member since it involves spending one’s own money with very little benefit to be gained. The real big men are not interested. The workers have no time.

**Community and context**

201. **There are various associations, networks and individuals contributing to school development. Some of them currently work in isolation of SBMC out of ignorance of its existence.**
In the past PTA in Lagos has been essential to smooth running of schools. State Level PTA, claims that they are finding ways to help schools despite bans on levies – by giving voluntary donations in kind for example.
CDA in Lagos is a force to be reckoned with. A lot of school development has been done by them in the past. They too are under local government control. The issue with these is that they seem to be only for people indigenous to the community, or land holders.

202. **Nigeria is large and diverse and the issues in SBMC implementation very with context.**
Lagos had a good reason for introducing Cluster SBMCs though this causes a disconnection between SBMC and community. But community is difficult to define in Lagos. The research communities were deliberately chosen as ones that were relatively clearly defined but may not have been typical in that respect.

Other interventions

203. Organisations rooted in the community make contributions that may have a more sustainable effect, e.g. Islamiyyah Schools.

In Alimosho LGA, COMPASS worked in 35 government schools and 11 Islamiyyah schools (as they are spelled in Lagos). It worked with PTA. COMPASS appears to be a well thought out programme aiming at sustainability. It would be interesting to see their reports but the fact that they worked in Islamiyyah Schools suggests they might agree with this statement.

CLEDEP took place in Lagos 1 3 years ago and the new Head teacher knew nothing about it.

Contributions from local ‘big men’ on the other hand make a big impression on the minds of community members out of all proportion to the benefits gained, and may disempower communities. Commercial companies also donate large sums and use this as an opportunity to advertise products which may have negative effects on health. Lagos 2’s Oba contributed N150000 sometime in the past and everyone from State level to community level stakeholders still talk about it.

204. Interventions at school, community or Government level have brought about some changes in schools but changes in Government policy along with posting of teachers away from the target community have brought project sustainability into question.

PTA had an important role in keeping the Lagos school system going and people are devastated by its ‘abolition’. (PTA chair, HTs, teachers) (Lagos 1 community members at feedback session ‘we want PTA back!’)

205. SBMCs are more active in GEP and SESP schools.

None in Lagos.

Inclusion

206. Even though the SBMC guidance notes emphasise children’s membership in the SBMC, in most school communities children are not recognised as having any key role to play in the SBMC. In most schools and communities women’s role and participation in the SBMC appears to be constrained by many factors.

In Lagos women are present on SBMC but do not hold positions of power. They are accepted on SBMC but there could be an issue here. Education is not a high status activity in Lagos and might be considered good enough for women.

Children do not attend SBMC and the Oba thinks they have no place there. (The only pupil whose name appeared on a SBMC list was a JSS student. Chair of SBMC Cluster 5 is a Secondary School teacher.

Oba of Lagos 2 spoke more of Community Secondary School than of Primary Schools. Question arises whether Clustering leads to more emphasis on JSS than Primary. There seems to be more interest in secondary education.
Teaching and Learning

207. **Standards of teaching and learning and availability of instructional materials are so inadequate that SBMC alone cannot realistically provide solutions.**

In Lagos there are some older teachers who have passed through good training in the old days and are now in positions of authority in the schools. Less well trained and less experienced teachers are unlikely to be able to maintain the standard unless there are more classrooms, materials, books, teachers, etc. Even if the community were to have enough resources to cover schools’ material needs they would not be able to deal with the major issue of teacher training and recruitment to the teaching profession.